



## Memphis Area Transit Authority

*MATA'S MISSION:* To provide a reliable, safe, accessible, clean and customer-friendly Public Transportation System that meets the needs of the community.

### Board of Commissioners

---

Chairman – Sean Healy

Vice Chairman – Marion McClendon

Commissioners

Karl Birkholz

M. P. Carter

Charles “Chooch” Pickard

John C. Vergos

Andre Gibson

---

Board of Commissioners Meeting  
Monday, February 25, 2013  
3:30 pm

- |      |   |                |
|------|---|----------------|
| I.   | CALL TO ORDER   | Sean Healy     |
| II.  | BOARD ROLL CALL   | Linda Eskridge |
| III. | APPROVAL of January 28, 2013 Minutes  | Sean Healy     |
| IV.  | BUSINESS & REPORTS  | Sean Healy     |
| A.   | <u>FINANCE COMMITTEE</u>  |                |
|      | 1. Resolution to Award an On-call contract to Tolar Manufacturing Company for Bus Shelters - Res. No. 13-08 | William Hudson |
| B.   | <u>SERVICE AND DEVELOPMENT</u>  |                |
|      | 1. Resolution to Amend MATA Speakers Guidelines for Board of Commissioners Meeting - Res. No. 13-09         | William Hudson |
| V.   | FINANCIAL REPORT  | Gilbert Noble  |

**Page 2**

**VI. MARKETING REPORT**

**Alison Burton**

**VII. GENERAL MANAGER'S REPORT**

**William Hudson**

**VIII. SPEAKERS**

**IX. OLD/NEW BUSINESS**

**Sean Healy**

**MINUTES OF BOARD MEETING**  
**MEMPHIS AREA TRANSIT AUTHORITY**  
**January 28, 2013**

---

A regular meeting of the MATA Board of Commissioners was held at 3:30 p.m. on Monday January 28, 2013 at 1370 Levee Road in the MATA Board Room.

**BOARD PRESENT:** Chairman, Mr. Sean Healy  
Commissioners: Karl Birkholz; Mattie Carter (late); Charles Pickard; Sean Healy  
Andre Gibson; John Vergos  
**Absent:** Marion McClendon

**STAFF:** Lawson Albritton; Alison Burton; Yuri Chambers; Darryl Covington;  
Lavelle Fitch; Don Forsee; Tom Fox; William Hudson; John Lancaster;  
Glen Lockhart; Maury Miles; Gilbert Noble; Alvin Pearson; Niketa Reed;  
Tommy Wallace

**OTHERS:** Betty Anderson, Travel Trainer; Gary Ferguson, TDOT-SSO Bennett Foster, MBRU; Aury Kangelos, TDOT; David Mason, MBRU; Eddie Settles, backinrivarcity.com; Larry Smith, Health Department; Carlos McCloud, TDOT; Sheila Williams, MBRU; Betty Robinson, MBRU; Henry Wilson, MATA Retiree

Chairman Healy called the meeting to order and called for Board roll call. The secretary, Linda Eskridge called the Board roll. Five Board Members were present, one Board Member Mattie Carter was late and one Board Member, Marion McClendon was absent. There was a quorum for the meeting. Chairman Healy called for approval of the November 26, 2012 Board Minutes. Mr. Birkholz made a motion for approval. Mr. Gibson seconded the motion and the November Board minutes were unanimously approved.

**BUSINESS & REPORTS**

**A. FINANCE COMMITTEE**

**1. Resolution to Authorize a Memorandum of Agreement with the Shelby County Health Department for a Diesel Retrofit Project - Res. No. 13-01**

**Discussion:** Dr. Fox presented this resolution to the Board. MATA has been working with the Health Department on a number of projects. This is a program that the Health Department has through TDOT funded 100%. MATA has been working with them for a while and have reached the point of moving forward. This resolution would authorize an agreement between MATA and the Health Department to carry out this project. Larry Smith from the Health Department was present at the meeting.

There are 76 buses that could be retrofitted and they would give us \$700,000 to do this project. **Mr. Pickard moved that Resolution No. 13-01 be approved. Mr. Vergos seconded the motion and the resolution was unanimously approved.**

**2. Resolution to Approve Purchase of Unleaded Gasoline - Res. No. 13-02**

**Discussion:** Mr. Hudson presented this resolution to the Board. MATA sent out bids to 27 vendors, with receipt of 4 secured and unsecured pricing for unleaded gasoline. Staff is recommending approval of a one year contract to Ports Petroleum Company, Inc. for the purchase of 45,000 gallons at a cost of \$2.8130 per gallon, which is about the same that we are currently paying. **Mr. Vergos moved that Resolution No. 13-02 be approved. Mr. Pickard seconded the motion and the resolution was unanimously approved.**

**3. Resolution to Approve Purchase of Diesel Fuel - Res. No. 13-03**

**Discussion:** Mr. Hudson presented this resolution to the Board. This is for 1,800,000 gallons of ultra-low sulfur diesel fuel. Bids were solicited to 25 vendors and 4 bids were received for secured and unsecured pricing. Mansfield Oil Company submitted the lowest secure bid at \$3.0534 per gallon. This bid is approximately \$127,000 better than our current contract. **Mr. Vergos moved that Resolution No. 13-03 be approved. Mr. Birkholz seconded the motion and the resolution was unanimously approved.**

**B. SERVICE AND DEVELOPMENT**

**1. Resolution to Approve FY13 Section 5307 Formula Capital Projects and State Operating Assistance - Res. No. 13-04**

**2. Resolution to Approve FY13 Section 5309 Bus and Bus Facilities Capital Projects -Res. No. 13-05**

**3. Resolution to Approve FY13 Section 5337 State of Good Repair Capital Projects -Res. No. 13-06**

**4. Resolution to Approve FY13 Section 5339 Bus and Bus Facilities Capital Projects -Res. No. 13-07**

**Discussion:** Maury Miles gave a brief overview of all four grants applications. Congress passed a new transportation bill called MAP21 effective October 1, 2012. It authorized funding for FY13 and FY14. MAP21 changed a lot of the funding that MATA and other grantees receive. Changes include: Eliminating 5309 Fixed-Guide way Modernization funds and replacing it with 5337 State of Good Repair funds which are for the trolley system; 5309 Bus and Bus Facilities funds were replaced with 5339 Bus and Bus Facilities funds; and it eliminated funding for the 5316 Jobs Access/Reverse Commute (JARC) program although Section 5307 funds can now be used to fund JARC programs. He explained that each year MATA has to apply and send resolutions separately because of the different types of funds, and the funds cannot be mixed. MATA has funds from four different types of grants that will cover the purchase of up to 30 buses - 15 hybrid-electric and 15 diesels. Maury explained to the Board how the buses would be funded between the grants.

He then explained the role of each grant resolution and the other line items in them including Preventive Maintenance, ADA Paratransit service, Associated Transit Improvements, Spare Bus Components, and Bus Facility Improvements. He also discussed the State Operating Assistance for FY13. **Mr. Birkholz moved that Resolution Nos. 13-04, 13-05, 13-06 and 13-07 be approved. Mr. Gibson seconded the motion and the resolutions were unanimously approved.**

## **FINANCIAL REPORT (1<sup>st</sup> Six Months of FY2013) Gil Noble**

Revenues for the 1<sup>st</sup> six months are \$34.2MM, which are unfavorable to budget by \$1MM. We still expect to be tracking on budget at unfavorable variance primarily due to city operating funds we not yet requested. P&L expenses are favorable to budget about \$600,000, primarily due to a one-year legislative relief we received on making our employer pension contributions. We do expect in the 2<sup>nd</sup> six months, on the one hand, we will have an additional favorable impact on the pension contribution from what was budgeted, but on the other hand we have a decrease in the amount of federal formula funds that we will receive about \$400,000 less in this fiscal year than budgeted. That decrease will affect FY2014 where we are expecting to see \$1.5MM less than budgeted and it has to do with our being in a different category for federal funding. We are expecting the next six months to be roughly on budget again, slightly favorable to budget. Mr. Noble stated that we will have another difficult year next year, but do not anticipate having a problem getting to the end of this fiscal year, June 30, 2013.

Mr. Noble stated the chart showing the salary cost for the second quarter is reflecting no significant reduction in headcount from the prior two years, and is expecting that trend to continue. A \$4.5MM deficit was budgeted, but is not expected to go beyond that. Mr. Vergos made his point regarding the pension and the reality of it, and the fact that it is operating with a significant deficit. Mr. Hudson stated that we did negotiate a separate, but less lucrative, pension plan in the last union negotiation, and the contract has been approved.

This ended the financial report.

**MARKETING REPORT**  
**December 2012 – January 2013**  
**Alison Burton**

**Instructional Video features Trolley**

Staff worked with Archer –Malmo for use of a trolley. The instructional video is for FedEx on a mobile app to teach customers how to use your cell phone to send a package. It's so easy you can send a package while riding on the trolley.

**Fall Retiree Summit – November 28**

The marketing staff helped to coordinate a luncheon for all MATA retirees. The event included updates on our pension plan, overall MATA operations, beautiful holiday photos, and a delicious lunch, tours of the train and trolley museum and door prizes. Over 250 retirees and spouses attended and all enjoyed seeing co-workers and friends. Staff received numerous positive comments from the retirees.

**Service Changes**

New service changes were effective on December 2. The changes were approved by the Board of Commissioners on October 22. Staff heavily promoted the changes to customers for the next five weeks. The most reaction on the changes came from residents on Route 19 Vollintine. Mr. Hudson has met with those residents to resolve their concerns.

**Customer Service**

For the first time in 36-year history of our customer service department, we collected over one million dollars in revenue at the North End Terminal. We recorded a 19 % increase over 2011 for a total of \$1,141,843.25. This gained can easily be attributed to more customers now understand the benefits of the fast pass. The fast pass was introduced in January 2010, and we have steadily seen more customers using the fast pass.

The American Way Transit dipped by 11% in overall revenue collection from \$280,191.42 in 2011 to \$249,348.39 in 2012. The loss is due to a drop in MATApplus sales at this location. The Airways Transit Center collected \$25,538.50 in revenue in 2012.

## **Upcoming Events for 2013:**

### **Safer More Secure MATA through Technology**

Built on the services that are all a part of Intelligent Transportation System that rolled out during 2012 and continues to be implemented in 2013 – pitch a full story on how MATA is a safer, more secure, more customer focused and more accurate transit system than ever before. This outreach will first be developed into a release that is pitched to the media. Any media interested is also invited to “witness” first hand any aspect of the operation. There will be several other components added to this. The promotional aspects of this project were delayed due to a few glitches most have been resolved, and we are now ready to seriously promote MATA Traveler.

### **Trolley Turns 20**

The two decade success of the Trolley system in Memphis is reason for an extensive month-long celebration. Such a celebration will present an opportunity to highlight the history of the trolley, the milestones reached and the complete statistics on how many people have experienced the Memphis MATA Trolley. April 20 is the anniversary, so that makes April the logical month. It could, however, be held for a month or two and still be relevant.

### **U-Pass Launch**

The creation of a U-Pass presents an opportunity to announce a new community focused service. While it would be ideal to announce in combination with a new University customer who signs on, it can be done independent of that as an announcement of the program and what it offers.

If done with a University customer, then timing will be dependent upon them. If no customer, a summer launch prior to school starting in the fall would work. We have held meetings with Christian Brothers, University of Memphis, Lemoyne, and a meeting with Southwest will be rescheduled.

### **Customer Appreciation Day**

This annual event has been held in April and can be built into Trolley Month. It presents an opportunity to highlight certain customer service stats about MATA in terms of ridership, services, etc. Previous events have yield huge crowds and loads of fun with our customers.

For 2013, the marketing staff will undertake a strategic outreach on positive news. This will include regular outreach and publicity about the ongoing changes and state of the business, as well as focused public relations and communications on several larger events/milestones/advances.

## **GENERAL MANAGER'S REPORT**

### **William Hudson**

Mr. Hudson congratulated Mr. Healy on his appointment to Chairman of the MATA Board.

Mr. Hudson took this opportunity to commend staff for the great job they do. His focus today was on the Purchasing Department who worked hard on getting bids in for our diesel and gasoline fuel. Due to their hard work they were very proud to find out that we actually did better this year on the bids than last year.

Mr. Hudson asked Dr. Fox to discuss the performance measures that the staff has been work on for the Board. Dr. Fox stated staff has been reporting performance measures to the MATA Board since July 2012. Dr. Fox distributed November and December's report at the meeting. Based on six months worth of data staff developed recommendations for what our target should be for each measure broken down by modes. The memo gives staff's recommendation and we are striving for improvement. The bold numbers in the table is what staff is recommending as a target for at least the 1<sup>st</sup> six months of this year. Staff will re-access and report back to the Board. Chairman Healy commented that there are some very aggressive targets in the report and he is encouraged by this. He commented on the on-time performance target and stated that hitting that target would go a long way in letting the customer know that we are serious about on-time performance. Mr. Gibson agreed with Chairman Healy and stated that if these targets are reached it would improve the budget.

### **Title VI Program**

The Board must adopt the Title VI Program prior to any changes, and must have the changes and approval in order to provide such changes by June 2013. Each FTA participant must ask, submit and get this approved by April 2013. John Lancaster showed a Power Point Presentation to the Board that explained the new Title VI Requirement and MATA will be working with the Board in the future on short time lines. John stated that hopefully by February staff will get some example policies to the Board for review and then get information to the public for input and comments.



After conducting some public outreach staff will need to come back to the Board in March or April to get approval from the Board to take action on the recommended policy.

Mr. Hudson continued the GM report by stating that we are in the process of working with on the 2014 budget. Mr. Hudson met with the mayor, and also Mr. Hudson, Dr. Fox, and Mr. Noble met with the city finance division.

They advised that we had lost about \$2MM less going into 2014. It will be tough and will keep the board updated. Once city finance determines what number to recommend to the Memphis City Council, we will pass it on to the MATA Board.

**SPEAKERS:** There were no speakers.

Chairman Healy called for recognition of visitors. Ms. Carter recognized each visitor by name and thanked each one for attending and stated that our doors are always open. Mr. Carlos McCloud, formerly with MPO, stated that he is no longer with MPO, but is now with TDOT, who has established an office in Memphis Region IV called the Office of Community Transportation, and will be here to provide resources for MATA. Mr. McCloud also stated that Mr. Aury Kangelos, also with TDOT will attend the MATA Board Meetings as available.

**OLD/NEW BUSINESS:**

Chairman Healy called for any old or new business to come before the MATA Board. Mr. Pickard made a motion to adopt a speaker's policy similar to Memphis City Council. The changes would include instead of Council, it would be MATA Board of Commissioners, replace sergeant at arms, with secretary, and keep our MATA 3-minute timeframe for speakers. Mr. Vergos seconded the motion. Ms. Carter stated that our original policy came from MCC and MATA made adjustments to modify it to MATA. Mr. Birkholz made a secondary motion to rewrite the policy with changes, to know what we are voting on, review it again, and make a final decision after final review. Ms. Carter seconded the motion, but the secondary motion failed. After much discussion between the MATA Board, Chairman Healy confirmed the motion on the floor is to amend our existing Board Meeting Policy and incorporate the Memphis City Council Speakers' policy into it. The motion was approved by the MATA Board of Commissioners and a resolution will be written to that effect.

Page 8  
1/28/13 minutes

Chairman Healy called for any other new or old business. The secretary stated that MATA's next Board Meeting is scheduled for February 25, 2013 at 3:30 p.m. Mr. Vergos moved that the meeting be adjourned. Mr. Gibson seconded the motion and the meeting was adjourned.

---

**Sean Healy**  
**Chairman of the MATA Board**

*NOTE: A taped recording of the MATA Board of Commissioner Meetings are always available in the event of clarity on a particular item.*

**MEMPHIS AREA TRANSIT AUTHORITY  
BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS**

**RESOLUTION NO. 13-08**

**RESOLUTION TO AWARD AN ON-CALL CONTRACT TO TOLAR  
MANUFACTURING COMPANY FOR BUS SHELTERS**

**WHEREAS, MATA owns bus shelters that have reached the end of their useful economic life and need replacement; and**

**WHEREAS, There are additional locations where shelters are needed; and**

**WHEREAS, It is in MATA's best interest to supplement the shelters that are provided under contract by Clear Channel; and**

**WHEREAS, MATA issued a Request for Proposal (RFP) for companies to provide shelters on an as-needed basis for a five (5) year period and received five (5) proposals; and**

**WHEREAS, An Evaluation Committee reviewed and rated the proposals using the Best Value method and determined the top ranked proposer to be Tolar Manufacturing Company, Inc.; and**

**WHEREAS, Unit prices have been negotiated for various types of shelters as well as accessories for each year of the contract; and**

**WHEREAS, MATA may purchase up to a maximum of 150 shelters over the five-year contract period, depending on funding; and**

**WHEREAS, The estimated cost of the contract, based on 150 shelters at the "base" shelter price is \$577,050 over five years; and**

**WHEREAS, Staff recommends award of a contract to Tolar Manufacturing.**

**WHEREAS, MATA will solicit prices separately for installation.**

**NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED BY THE MEMPHIS AREA TRANSIT AUTHORITY BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS, That a contract be awarded to Tolar Manufacturing Company for up to 150 bus shelters and accessories as needed over a five year period at a cost of \$577,050.**

**BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED That the Chairman, Vice Chairman or President/General Manager be authorized to execute the contract.**

**\* \* \* \* \***

**Motion Made By: Charles Pickard      SECONDED: Andre Gibson**

**YEA:    Mattie Carter; John Vergos; Karl Birkholz; Andre Gibson; Sean Healy; Charles Pickard;  
         Marion McClendon**

**NAY:    None**

**Approved: February 25, 2013**

**Absent at Time:    None**



## MEMO

**TO:** MATA Board of Commissioners

**FROM:** William Hudson, Jr. President/General Manager

**SUBJECT:** Bus Shelter Procurement  
RFP 12-18

**DATE:** February 19, 2013

---

This memo summarizes the procurement and evaluation process for a supplier to provide bus shelters on an as-needed basis over a five year period. MATA intends to supplement the efforts of Clear Channel by replacing MATA-owned shelters and adding new shelters as funding is available. We stated in the RFP that the estimated quantity of shelters was 20 per year, or 100 over the five-year contract period. However, for the purpose of the contract we have set a minimum of 40 (an average of 8 per year) and a maximum of 150 (an average of 30 per year) to give us flexibility to adjust the quantity based on funding availability. MATA intends to purchase a variety of shelter types to be able to customize shelters to individual locations. Other accessories, such as advertising panels, solar lights, bicycle racks, and trash receptacles, are also included.

The following technical evaluation criteria and weights were established for evaluating proposals:

- a. Overall Design Concepts and Features of Proposed Shelters (60%)
- b. Experience, Past Performance, and Ability to Meet Obligations (30%)
- c. References (10%)

An Evaluation Committee was established consisting of four MATA staff members.

The Best Value method was used to determine the recommendation. With the Best Value method, prices are not scored but are presented alongside technical qualifications and Committee members judge the trade-off between technical merit and price to arrive at a decision on the best value to MATA.

The goal for participation by Disadvantaged Business Enterprises (DBE) was set at 0% since this procurement is only for supplying manufactured shelters. MATA will issue a separate solicitation for installation of shelters which is expected to have a DBE goal.

Five (5) proposals were received. The Evaluation Committee reviewed and rated each proposal on each technical criterion using an ordinal scale (1,2,3,4,5) with 1 being best and 5 being worst. After scoring the proposals on the technical criteria, the Evaluation Committee was given the cost proposals. Committee members assessed Best Value based on the following information:

<b>Proposer</b>	<b>Technical Score</b>	<b>Technical Rank</b>	<b>Pricing (*)</b>	<b>Pricing Rank</b>
<b>Brasco International</b>	<b>8.0</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>\$107,500</b>	<b>5</b>
<b>Columbia Equipment Co.</b>	<b>17.6</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>\$ 92,500</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>Duo-Gard</b>	<b>13.4</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>\$ 79,620</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>Handi-Hut, Inc.</b>	<b>16.7</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>\$71,080</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>Tolar Manufacturing</b>	<b>4.0</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>\$74,040</b>	<b>2</b>

(\*) based on an order of 20 “Base” Shelters at Year 1 prices, including shipping. Prices escalate in Years 2-5.

After a discussion of trade-offs between technical merit and cost, the Committee recommended the contract to be awarded to Tolar Manufacturing. Tolar was rated best on technical merit and second best on price.

The maximum value of the contract, as presented in the Board resolution is based on the maximum quantity of shelters that could be purchased (150). It was calculated by taking the base shelter cost per year, multiplying by 30 shelters per year and summing to derive a total of \$577,050.

**MEMPHIS AREA TRANSIT AUTHORITY  
BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS**

**RESOLUTION NO. 13-09**

**RESOLUTION TO AMEND MATA SPEAKER GUIDELINES FOR BOARD OF  
COMMISSIONERS MEETING**

**WHEREAS, It becomes necessary from time to time to amend certain policies and/or guidelines; and**

**WHEREAS, As of the January 25, 2013 MATA Board of Commissioners voted to amend MATA's Speaker Policy to reflect that of The Memphis City Council's Speaker Policy; and**

**WHEREAS, The amended policy is attached.**

**NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED BY THE MEMPHIS AREA TRANSIT AUTHORITY BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS, That the amendment to the MATA guidelines for speakers is adopted.**

**\* \* \* \* \***

**Motion Made By: John Vergos                      SECONDED: Marion McClendon**

**YEA:    Mattie Carter; John Vergos; Karl Birkholz; Andre Gibson; Sean Healy; Charles Pickard;  
          Marion McClendon**

**NAY:    None**

**Approved: February 25, 2013**

**Absent at Time:    None**

## GUIDELINES FOR MATA BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS MEETINGS

1. Members of the public wishing to address the MATA Board on an agenda item shall sign in with the Secretary of the MATA Board and will be recognized by the Chairman at the appropriate time. When recognized, this person shall state his or her name and address and shall limit remarks to the specific question under debate. Comments shall be limited to three (3) minutes.
2. The time limit for each speaker is (3) minutes unless extended on a speaker-by-speaker basis by vote of the Board.
3. In the case of any disturbance or disorderly conduct in the Board Meeting, the Chairman shall have the power to order same to be cleared.
4. In the case of public hearings which debate the passage of a resolution, the Chairman may set time limitations in advance of the hearings; provided however that equal time be afforded to those who support such proposals and those who are in opposition. In the case of group opposition or group support, the Chairman may request agreement on a single spokesman for each group.
5. Persons seeking to speak during the section reserved for Speakers shall sign in with the Secretary, listing name and subject matter. At the conclusion of the regular business on the agenda, the Chairman will recognize those persons in the proper order of signatures as handed to him by the Board Secretary. Recognition of any person who failed to sign-in will be discouraged, but final decision shall rest with the Chairman. Persons who register to speak during this period will have a maximum of three (3) minutes to speak.
6. All citizens' comments, suggestions, and complaints as to MATA service and operations should be directed to the President/General Manager. The President/General Manager shall route the comment, suggestion, or complaint to the appropriate division or director, who shall report back to the President/General Manager within five (5) working days. The President/General Manager shall then report the action to be taken to both the citizen and the Board.
7. Based on citizen's comments, suggestions, and complaints as to MATA service and operations, it will be determined by the Chairman or the President/General Manager if an immediate response is required at the meeting, or if the response will be transmitted to the citizen in a reasonable time after the Board Meeting.
8. MATA Board meetings are scheduled each 4<sup>th</sup> Monday of the month, beginning at 3:30 p.m. in the Board Room at 1370 Levee Road unless otherwise noted. Any notice of change in Board meeting location or time will be provided prior to the meeting. A meeting notice is provided for all citizens three (3) working days prior to the meetings.