MINUTES OF 9/27/16 TEM



#### Memphis Area Transit Authority

MATA'S MISSION: To provide a reliable, safe, accessible, clean and customer-friendly Public Transportation System that meets the needs of the community.

#### Ronald L. Garrison Chief Executive Officer

Chairman - Sean Healy	Board of Commissioners		
Vice Chairman - Andre Gibson	Commissioners		
	Kristen Bland	Lauren Taylor	
	Roquita Coleman-Williams	John C. Vergos	
	Martin Lipinski	Shelia Williams	
	Tommy Pacello		

#### Board of Commissioners Meeting Tuesday, September 27, 2016 - 3:30 p.m. 1370 Levee Road

I. **CALL TO ORDER** Sean Healy II. **BOARD ROLL CALL & OBSERVATIONS** Linda Eskridge III. **APPROVE July 26, 2016 BOARD MINUTES** IV. **CEO REPORT** Sean Healy Ronald Garrison V. Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) Discussion VI. **ACTION ITEMS:** Sean Healy A. **FINANCE COMMITTEE** 1. Resolution to Authorize a Change Order To the Contract with ORX for the Refurbishment/Repair of Melbourne MCB Trolley Trucks - Res. No. 16-27 Ron Garrison

> Resolution to Award a Contract for Transit Management Service to First Transit, Inc. - Res. No. 16-28

Sean Healy/ Bruce Smith

MINUTES OF 9/27/16 EM I

#### Page 2

3. Resolution to Extend Term of Appointment of Ronald L. Garrison for President/
General Manager – Res. No. 16-29

Sean Healy

4. Resolution to Extend the Term and Increase the Amount of the On-Call Contract with Shelby Electric Company for Rail System and Facility Electrical Services

- Res. No. 16-30

Ron Garrison

#### B. SERVICE AND DEVELOPMENT

 Resolution to Award a Contract to Mid-South Bus Sales for the Purchase of 10 Wheelchair -Accessible Vans - Res. No. 16-31

Ron Garrison

2. Resolution to Extend Lease of Vehicles From Creative Bus Sales for MATAPlus Service - Res. No. 16-32

Ron Garrison

3. Resolution to Approve Service Changes
- Res. No. 16-33

Ron Garrison

VII. FINANCE REPORT

Gil Noble

VIII. SPEAKERS
(Please fill out a Speaker's card)

Lawson Albritton

IX. OLD/NEW BUSINESS

Sean Healy

Future Board Meetings:

- November 15, 2016 @ 3:30 p.m.
- December 6, 2016 @ 3:30 p.m.

MINUTE OF GAMILLIEM III

# MINUTES OF BOARD MEETING MEMPHIS AREA TRANSIT AUTHORITY July 26, 2016

CALL TO ORDER: A regular meeting of the MATA Board of Commissioners was called to order by Vice-Chairman Andre Gibson at 3:30 p.m. on Tuesday July 26, 2016 at 1370 Levee Road.

#### **BOARD ROLL CALL:**

Present:

Vice Chairman Andre Gibson

Commissioners: Shelia Williams; John Vergos; Kristen Bland;

Charles Pickard

Absent:

Chairman Sean Healy; Lauren Taylor; Roquita Coleman-Williams;

Martin Lipinski

Quorum:

Yes

Staff:

Lawson Albritton, Senior Administrative Officer, Alison Burton, Director Marketing/Customer Relations; Linda Eskridge, Executive Office Manager; Ron Garrison, Chief Executive Officer; Nicole Lacey, Chief Communications Officer; John Lancaster, Director of Planning & Scheduling; Maury Miles, Director of Grants & Procurement; Al McCoy, Asst. Finance Director; Gil Noble, Chief Financial Officer;; Alvin Pearson, Chief Operations Officer; Scarlet Ponder, Planner; Gary Rosenfeld, Chief Administrative Officer; Susan Schubert, Human Resource Director

Guests:

#### **MCIL/STAC Attendees:**

Memphis Bus Riders Union: Cynthia Bailey; Justin Davis; Sammie Hunter

<u>Amalgamated Transit Union:</u> Willie Barber; Thomas Davidson; Angela Smith; Terry Moss; Fred Williams; Anthony Garland, ATU International Union Representative

Others: Kwasi Agyakwa, MPO; Suzanne Carlson, Innovate Memphis; Tom Charlier, the Commercial Appeal; Lydia Crawford, City of Memphis Law Division; Jason Hill, Rider; Dennis Lynch, Sierre Club; Carlos McCloud, TDOT; Colin McDonald, Innovate



Memphis; Johnnie Mosley, Citizens for Better Services; Nicholas Oyler, MPO; Emily Tampati, TDOT; Jamita Swearengen, Memphis City Council; Susan Steffens, City of Memphis; James Stokes, Bass River Advisors; Gilda Williams, MATA Patron

Linda Eskridge, Board Secretary welcomed all guests to the July Board of Commissioners Meeting. Ms. Eskridge also made the usual Board Meeting observations, as well as encouraged everyone to visit the MATA website for updates on any Board Meeting changes or other MATA updates. Ms. Eskridge reminded the guest that their concerns and questions would either be forwarded to them in writing or a staff person would get with them at the close of the meeting.

**APPROVAL OF JUNE, 2016 MINUTES**: Mr. Vergos moved that the June minutes be approved. Ms. Williams seconded the motion and the minutes were unanimously approved.

#### CEO's REPORT Mr. Ronald Garrison

MATA will be hosting the Annual Tennessee Public Transportation Association Conference in Memphis, TN on October 25-28, 2016. All are invited to attend. Board Meeting dates will change and Linda Eskridge will keep the Board and guest abreast of the changes in the Board of Commissioners' meetings.

Mr. Garrison discussed the key performance indicators with the Board as well as noted the new format of the report. Ridership is down across the country MATA's ridership is down over 100,000 for the month. Mr. Garrison also took the opportunity to thank staff, operators and mechanics that worked hard to improve the On-time Performance. He also thanked the customer service staff, operators, and supervisors with the improvements in customer service complaints. We plan to continue training in this area as well. There was an improvement in preventable accidents in every area. This is a good indication of where MATA is headed towards better service, more reliable service and safe service and good customer service. Vice-Chairman Gibson took the opportunity to congratulate staff as well on the improvements. Mr. Vergos stated that he is pleased with the format of the performance indicators and it is much easier to read and understand. MATA's new Chief Communications Officer, Nicole Lacey, was very instrumental in creating the new format of the report.

Mr. Garrison thanked Mr. Gibson for his visit to Washington with the MATA staff to meet with the Administrator to solicit for additional funds for MATA. Mr. Gibson's boss, Phil Trenary, CEO of the Memphis Chamber went along as well in support of MATA. Mr. Garrison also thanked Mr. Gibson and Ms. Shelia Williams for their assistance in helping MATA with the Dump the Pump Event.



Trolley 1799 is nearly done with refurbishment and should be delivered in August and there will be a big celebration when this happens. Also Trolley 453 looks brand new with new safety features done on this as well. This is slated for later this month or early next month at the latest. We have also started working on Trolley 540 and it is 15% rehabilitated.

MATA has had its performance review with Mayor Strickland and he has been very complimentary. They have been tracking statistics on all departments and every month MATA's statistics have continued to go up.

MATA had a meeting with Senator Lee Harris from the State. Senator Harris has visited MATA before. He met with Mr. Rosenfeld, CAO and Mr. Harris had questions relative to the process to implement service and any road blocks that we have to implementing service. We discussed transit funding as a key issue and the biggest road block is the increase in service. Senator Harrison did not have time to tour the facility, but was invited back for a tour of the facility. He was very appreciative and we have exchanged emails as he sends his gratitude to staff for meeting with him. Mr. Gibson asked if we could use Senator Harris as leverage to get the whole delegations out to MATA. Mr. Garrison stated that he went to Nashville to meet with them and he feels that is a good idea.

There have been great updates on IT and on-time performance. Some systems went down because of their age, and we got them back up and our ability to count ridership which slows down our work on the transit plan. We have a new website management and we are implementing a new policy for security. Mr. Rosenfeld is working with our vendor on extending our warranty and developing a new contract on the on-board system. We are now getting good data from the system. MATAplus is improving in our customers per hours. There are 19,000 trips requested and 14,000 are completed. Hudson Transit Center continues to get improvements in the restroom.

#### **ACTION ITEMS:**

#### A. FINANCE COMMITTEE

1. Resolution to Approve Operating Budget for Fiscal Year 2017 - Res. No. 16-21

Discussion: CFO, Gil Noble, presented this resolution to the Board of Commissioners. We are asking the Board to approve a budget operating expenses of \$62,201,660. We are estimating revenues of only \$55.7 million which would result in an operating deficit of \$6,497,867. MATA has been in a deficit position for about the last 7 or 8 fiscal years, ever since we were obligated to start building our OPEB liability. Mr. Noble commented on the June Finance Report final slide, which pertains to this budget. This slide is the one that was talked about in the Finance Committee on two occasions and is a good summary of the key drivers to our \$62.2MM budget request. Mr. Noble explained the favorable items as well as the unfavorable items in this budget. The 2018 budget year will be extremely challenging. Henceforth, Staff is recommending this budget for Board's approval. Mr. Vergos moved that the Resolution be moved to the floor for discussion. Mr. Pickard seconded the motion. Mr. Vergos gave updates from the Finance Committee Meetings.



Mr. Vergos stated that two meetings were held, of which one was discussion of the Operating Budget presented by Mr. Noble. Mr. Noble gave a very lengthy proposal of the budget. The Finance Committee was satisfied that though MATA is short of funds, we feel the funds are being spent appropriately. We have seen some increase in our funding, as well as some expenses that need to be paid. Mr. Vergos feels that the public needs to understand that the budget is very precarious. Mr. Gibson also commented that this budget is not where we would like for it to be and it is important to know that this budget does include transit service improvements, facility improvements and dozens of new jobs. Mr. Gibson feels this will make us a stronger company, as well as assist us in telling our story. Resolution No. 16-21 was unanimously approved.

2. Resolution to Approve Capital Budget for Fiscal Year 2017 - Res. No. 16-22 CAO, Gary Rosenfeld presented this resolution to the MATA Discussion: Board. We have a capital budget in the amount of \$14,795,000. This is a planning document and none of these items are embedded and tested for an actual return on investment. This is not giving us the authorization to spend. Mr. Rosenfeld gave the breakdown of the funds by mode of service and equipment type. The \$10.4MM for buses includes the \$5MM that the City has given. We have 15 vehicles on order. Mr. Garrison added that due to good relations and forward thinking, MATA developed a Specification and Request for Proposal (RFP) working with Knoxville and Nashville. There is a two-year waiting list to buy a bus. In doing so, we have the ability to do a contract immediately, and do not have to do an RFP. Gillig, through their Board put the order in for 15 buses to be delivered in April, and they were just built in March. That is huge and is real positive for our customers, operators, and the City of Memphis. MATA is working on another RFP with FTA to see if we can rebuild some buses at a lesser expense, and will be coming back to the Board on that. Mr. Vergos moved that the resolution be moved to the floor for discussion. Mr. Pickard asked about the money for the ongoing renovation of the additional trolleys. Mr. Garrison stated that very little of it will come from operating, and most of it will come from Capital Grants and the Madison Avenue Grants. Mr. Rosenfeld gave a breakdown of what is included in the \$1.6MM in Facility Improvements, which was asked by Mr. Gibson. Mr. Vergos stated that he would like to see funds that were spent on the burned trolleys and how much was spent on consultation fees and solid hardware and their parts. Mr. Garrison stated that it is time for an update on this and he would bring an update back to the Board. Resolution No. 16-22 was unanimously approved. Mr. Vergos wanted to again reiterate to the public that MATA put out 36 routes, 107 buses, and we carry 8 to 9 million people a year, and 24 to 30 thousand people a day. In Mr. Vergos' opinion there are only three things we can get to increase funds that could make our system whole: 1) Implement the Short Range Transportation Plan; 2) Consider moving forward with the one-cent tax on gas; and 3) Opportunity for funding through FedEx by transporting passengers to the hub. The public needs to know there are some means of gaining revenues.



3. Resolution Authorize Insurance Coverage Res. No. 16-23

Discussion: CAO, Gary Rosenfeld presented this Resolution to the MATA Board. MATA's insurance brokers have done an outstanding job in bringing us quotes for our liability coverage program for the upcoming year. Insurance rates are going up slightly about 3.5% while their fees are going down. Insurance rates generally revolve around interest rates, which has gone down and insurance rates are going up in order to keep the cash flow adequate to cover claims. One change is taking the Worker's Compensation Insurance, the excess, from \$500,000 to \$550,000 which is saving us about \$10,000 a year on premium cost. MATA is looking for an approval today of \$697,851.00 for the period of August 1, 2016 to July 31, 2017 for all lines of coverage. Ms. Bland moved that the resolution be moved to the floor for discussion. Mr. Vergos seconded the motion. There were not questions. Resolution No. 16-23 was unanimously approved.

#### B. <u>SERVICE AND DEVELOPMENT</u>

Resolution to Award an On-Call Contract with BBI, Inc. for On-Call Services for Rail System Track and Facility Maintenance - Res. No. 16-24 Maury Miles, Director of Grants and Procurement, presented this resolution to the MATA Board. He stated that this is a multiple-year contract, and the last one was for five years. He stated that the contractor did a good job. He explained that the current contract expires at the end of this month and MATA had to resolicit. MATA received three proposals but two were nonresponsive because they did not meet the DBE Goal. The one that did meet the Goal is BBT, Inc. They gave good comparable hourly rates. They have the license to do this but are using two subcontractors -- River City Railroad to perform the work and Southland Enterprises to provide some of the equipment they may need. They both are certified DBEs and BBT, Inc. exceeded the DBE Goal. All the Evaluation Committee members gave them a high score and recommended that the Board award a contract to BBT, Inc. at a cost not to exceed \$375,000 over a five-year period. MATA based this amount on the expenditures that occurred over the last five years. Mr. Vergos moved that the resolution be moved to the floor for discussion. Ms. Shelia Williams seconded the motion. Mr. Vergos asked which tracks this contract would cover. Mr. Miles explained that it would cover all of MATA's tracks. He stated MATA has 10.5 miles of track and also the tracks inside the trolley maintenance facility. Mr. Gibson asked for a brief explanation on the cost proposal forms for each vendor. Mr. Miles stated that MATA asked all vendors to give us their prices for each year. This is a five-year contract and the attachments are the prices for each year. Those prices are the hourly rates for the job classifications as well as the cost for material. Mr. Miles stated that those costs are comparable to the previous contract's cost. Resolution No. 16-24 was unanimously approved.

### 2. Resolution to Designate Surplus Property and Authorization to Dispose - Res. No. 16-25

Discussion: CAO, Gary Rosenfeld presented this resolution to the MATA Board. He stated that this is a housekeeping item to keep in the records to show what the FTA Triennial Auditors will be reviewing next month.



Some of these vehicles have been declared surplus before, and we are trying to make it simple as we get ready for the audit process. It includes vehicles that have had some quality issues and also includes some vehicles that have had some accident damage. Mr. Vergos moved that the resolution be put on the floor for discussion. Mr. Pickard seconded the motion. Mr. Vergos asked for clarity on which buses had quality issues. Mr. Rosenfeld stated the Bluebirds, some Champion, and the Arboc buses were the one with the quality issues. Mr. Gibson asked about MATA's coverage as far as useful life is concerned. Mr. Garrison stated that we are working with FTA on the regulation for that. We think this will end up being good for us in so much as there are mistakes that will not be made again, and also we can get this debt paid off without it impacting our budget. The ballpark is probably around \$2.1MM. That will not have to come out of our capital or operating budget. Mr. Gibson stated that in disposing these buses off the lot, he would like for us to proactively seek more nonprofit options or education partners to sell or donate buses. Mr. Garrison stated anyway we can help the community we definitely would want to do so.

#### 3. Resolution to Designate Contingency Fleet - Res. No. 16-26

Discussion: CAO, Gary Rosenfeld presented this Resolution to the MATA Board. We want to designate these vehicles as part of the contingency fleet. If we are successful with the procurement of services to re-manufacturing of vehicles, these are the ones that would be manufactured. The idea over time is to eliminate or reduce the contingency fleet to just a few vehicles. Part of the rules for contingent fleet is that you have to keep them in operable condition but you don't get any extra money for having them. So we will look at reducing our exposure to those vehicles over time and reduce the list. Mr. Garrison stated that we may bring this back to the Board more often because we want to have the right amount of vehicles for an emergency or the right amount when we get new funding so that we can expand service or frequency. We are looking into this to see how we can get some FTA funding for this as we are thinking ahead by doing it now. Mr. Vergos moved that the resolution be moved to the floor for discussion. Mr. Pickard seconded the motion. There were no questions. Resolution No. 16-26 was unanimously approved.

#### **BOARD INFORMATIONAL ITEMS:**

There were five informational items included on the Agenda. One of the items was MBE/WMBE update and due to time, Mr. Gibson stated that this item would be moved to the next meeting. Mr. Garrison identified the top two highest priority items of the list. Mr. Garrison suggested staff give a brief update on the Transit Plan item, with a more thorough update at the September Board Meeting. Also there will be discussion on the Service Changes. A Service/Development Committee Meeting will be scheduled in August for more discussion on these items.



1) Transit Plan Update - John Lancaster, Director of Planning & Schedule and Scarlet Ponder, Planner

Mr. Lancaster gave a brief update on the Transit Plan and briefly introduced the service changes we are proposing for December. We are getting ready to go out for public notice for this process, and we will also show a new mapping tool. The big thing MATA is looking at with the Transit Plan is reviewing the downtown operations plan and rerouting our buses into Central Station and at the same time utilize more of Second and Third Streets and the Hudson Transit Center to improve our on-time performance. This also sets the stage for if we are successful with the TIGER Grant and how the BRT project would come in. The Title VI service standards were adopted by the Board in October 2014. These are required by FTA. There were a lot of CMAQ funding routes that we plan to implement for the December service change. The communications plan is vital for the implementation of all of these changes. Mr. Garrison made it clear that this is what we want to do, not what we are going to do. Of course all of this needs to go through the Board and is still a lot of work to do. Mr. Vergos asked what it cost to improve the headways annually. Mr. Lancaster stated that it would probably take an additional \$3MM, and gave an explanation on this. After the meeting, Mr. Lancaster check more into the cost and found that it is more between \$6MM - \$11MM. The presentation showed a broad picture of what MATA is proposing for December. We are looking at changes to about 23 routes out of 42. There are two routes we are looking at eliminating. These will have existing service or replacement service to replace them. The good news is we could possibly be looking at implementing six new routes into the system.

Ms. Ponder briefly showed what our new Remix software can do to enhance our routes. This is a web-based planning tool which allows us to visualize route changes quickly and easily. It cost roughly \$835,000/annually. It also gives demographic information on who this route serves. Mr. Garrison stated that this acts as a whole number of new databases and we can see real time of what the real stats are. This is a hugely valuable tool. This also showed what was recommended in the Transit Plan. It shows how it can affect travel time as a whole. Mr. Rosenfeld stated that we are excited because the information is in real time and it will guide us in the right direction.

CAC Formation Update – Mr. Lancaster stated that we are looking to bring this to the Service and Development Committee. We are also looking at some bylaws and a little more input on this. This will go before the committee first and then to the MATA Board. Some action may be required in September.



Financial Report June, 2016 Gil Noble, CFO

This is the final month of FY16 that ended on June 30th. Our Expenses were right on budget overall. Some things were high and some line items were low. Our Revenues reflect a preliminary yearend close, which will be adjusted with accrued grant revenue in upcoming weeks along with other auditors' year-end adjustments.

Cash Status - MATA lacks cash reserve, and much of the year, particularly in the spring, we are operating with a thin cash position. Mr. Noble stated that the City of Memphis reserve funds have increased from \$60MM to \$80MM in the last three years. Last year MATA ended in a negative position coming into the year. At FY16 year-end MATA had \$6.2MM in cash but owed \$6MM to the city for bridge funding, so that part will not be available as a cushion for the coming year. Mr. Noble stated that nevertheless, we are still about \$1.1 improved from the preceding year. At this point last year we had only \$3.5MM in cash and owed the city \$2.5MM and still had pension payment of \$1.9 that we had not made yet. So we entered the fiscal year with a deficit cash position in terms of having a cushion to protect us for the upcoming fiscal year. An adequate cushion would be about \$4MM or \$5MM, which re-emphasizes how difficult of a cash position that MATA is on a year-round basis. We haven't yet been able to begin rebuilding a significant cash reserve that will protect us when significant things go wrong. Mr. Vergos mentioned the discussion with the Finance Committee about evaluating being self-insured versus carry policies. Mr. Noble stated that we will look at that. We have looked at it in years past and there were some skepticism when they are saying you've got a deductible of \$1MM and a premium of \$1MM you're not really better off. If we look at it strictly as a catastrophic protection, it's worthwhile. Mr. Rosenfeld stated that we do have excess umbrella coverage for liabilities purposes.

#### **SPEAKERS:**

Justin Hill, 895 Charles Pl., Memphis, TN 38112 - Mr. Hill stated that ridership is increasing and buses are continuing to be late. He suggested bringing back some previous routes and having more buses running during the peak hours. He stated there are complaints on drivers because buses are late. He also stated that trolleys are breaking down and catching on fire. These are areas of concern for riders.



#### Thomas Davidson, ATU Local 713 -

- 1) The union would like to know the intent of Resolution No. 16-21
- 2) Is there anything different in Res. No. 16-21 that was not in the 2011 RFP.
- 3) (It was later determined that this was not the correct resolution for this discussion)
- 4) What is the role of First Transit under the current RFP.

Mr. Garrison stated that staff is available to meet with union at any time.

Mr. Anthony Garland, International Rep. for the ATU Local 713 was present at the meeting. He stated they don't really need to meet anymore, they just need clear answers on the questions so that they can move forward and interact with their passengers as well as members as a course of action to see if the RFP is beneficial to the community and the business aspect for the City of Memphis. Mr. Garland stated that between the agency and the Council, they are receiving different answers to the same questions. Mr. Gibson expressed that the Board is not a part of the negotiating process; however, they can direct the CEO to answer the questions brought forth in today's meeting. Resolution No. 16-21 was not the correct referenced resolution and Mr. Davidson will put their request in writing.

Mr. Anthony Garland, International Rep. for the Union - Mr. Garland was recognized at this point as a speaker on for his concerns. Mr. Garland stated regarding the December service changes, the direct effect is based on service decision by the agencies because of insufficient funds and the easy way to make up for the deficit is to consolidate routes. According to the service changes presentation, Mr. Garland stated that MATA is "chasing its tail." He stated the presentation is showing how the city has been redirected from the last service changes that took place and trying to catch up. Then the next year MATA would do the same presentation and try to catch up on the service changes for December, 2016. It is not the way to go when you are talking about providing a public service that's going to affect your direct ability to get funding for neighborhoods that are affected by transit. This agency has to be held accountable when they make decisions to consolidate routes that affect the city of Mr. Vergos asked Mr. Garland what he would suggest as the alternative to declining funding. Mr. Garland stated that International is working with the four states in the south to find more funding. He stated that the idea regarding the gas tax is worth discussion. Developers and businesses gain more out of public transit than any aspect of this city. There was much more discussion on this and an agreement was made to me with all parties involved.



Mr. Sammie Hunter, MBRU – Mr. Hunter expressed his concerns with the air conditioners not working on the buses. This is a matter that needs to be rectified. He stated that the MBRU want to meet with Mr. Garrison about when the new buses will be coming in. There is a big concern with the Route 31 being cut, as it beneficial to a lot of riders. Children cannot get to school because the #31 has been cut, as well as other problems because of the cut. He thanked the Board for listening.

#### **OLD/NEW BUSINESS:**

Mr. Gibson called for any old/new business. Mr. Pickard asked if there were any update on a solution with Bass Pro. Mr. Pearson stated that he would get something to Mr. Pickard as soon as possible. A safety team has been sent out to review this and will follow up with Mr. Pickard. Mr. Pickard recognized Councilwoman Jamita Swearengen who is MATA's liaison from the Memphis City Council. Councilwoman Swearengen stated that she has received several calls concerning the language in the First Transit Contract, which is up for renewal. She would like to meet before the contract goes into submittal. Mr. Garrison stated that he would give Councilwoman Swearengen a call with the correct date for the meeting. He also stated that he would like to have her over for a tour of MATA. He stated that he would get with MATA's attorney to get a full explanation on the First Transit contract. Mr. Garrison stated for the record that he has not gotten anything from anyone stating they wanted to meet with him regarding this contract. He stated that he would call Councilwoman Swearengen to schedule a meeting to discuss these concerns. Mr. Gibson stated that he would like a follow up from Mr. Garrison on their meeting with Councilwoman Swearengen.

The next Board Meeting is September 27, 2016 at 1370 Levee Road Memphis, TN 38108. Mr. Vergos moved that the meeting be adjourned. Mr. Pickard seconded the motion and the meeting was adjourned.

Mr. Andre Gibson Chairman

MINUTES OF 9/27/16 TEM VIAI

## MEMPHIS AREA TRANSIT AUTHORITY BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS

#### **RESOLUTION NO. 16-27**

# RESOLUTION TO AUTHORIZE A CHANGE ORDER TO THE CONTRACT WITH ORX FOR THE REFURBISHMENT/REPAIR OF MELBOURNE MCB TROLLEY TRUCKS

WHEREAS, The Memphis Area Transit Authority (MATA) Board of Commissioners approved Resolution No. 15-12 on April 27, 2015 to award a contract to ORX for the refurbishment/repair of four trolley trucks with an option for 20 additional trucks for a total cost of \$491,904; and

WHEREAS, The contract included costs for various additional services for individual components that might be required once ORX disassembled the trucks; and

WHEREAS, MATA estimated the cost for the additional services for a list of common components; and

WHEREAS, MATA gave ORX a Notice to Proceed for the first four trucks, and once ORX disassembled them, they informed MATA that there were other components not on the list that required repair and that some items required multiple units which resulted in a greater cost than included in the original contract amount; and

WHEREAS, The Board authorized a change order to cover the additional costs which totaled \$17,426 per truck or a total of \$69,704 for the first four trucks bringing the total value of the base order to \$151,688; and

WHEREAS, Additional work (reconditioning axle bearings, replacing elliptical springs, replacing the spring plank, line boring the traction motor, overhauling the traction motor bearing caps, aligning the traction motor armature pinion and replacement of the brake linkage) required that was not included in the original Scope of Work was necessary for the first four trucks after the first change order was approved; and

WHEREAS, MATA recommends giving ORX a Notice to Proceed for 12 more trucks, and ORX has stated that most of the extra work required on the first four trucks will also be required on the remaining 12 trucks; and

WHEREAS, Two of the trucks will require suspension modification due to the weight of Trolley 453; and

MINUTES OF 9/27/16 TEN TIAI

WHEREAS, The cost of the extra work stated above (plus a credit for eight thrust collars not needed on the first four trucks) will be \$390,136; and

WHEREAS, This amount is greater than 10% of the original contract which requires Board approval in accordance with MATA's Procurement Manual; and

WHEREAS, Staff has determined the extra cost to be fair and reasonable and recommends authorization of the change order.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED BY THE MEMPHIS AREA TRANSIT AUTHORITY BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS That Staff is authorized to give ORX a Notice to Proceed on 12 more trucks and that a change order is authorized in the amount of \$390,136 to increase the total cost of the contract with ORX for the refurbishment/repair of four Melbourne MCB trolley trucks with an option for 20 additional trucks to \$951,744.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED That the Contracting Officer is authorized to execute the change order with ORX.

\*\*\*\*\*

Motion Made By: John Vergos SECONDED: Martin Lipinski

YEA: Sean Healy; Andre Gibson; John Vergos; Shelia Williams; Kristen Bland; Roquita

Coleman-Williams; Martin Lipinski; Lauren Taylor; Tommy Pacello

NAY: None

Approved: September 27, 2016

Absent at Time: NONE

MINUTES OF 9/27/16 TEN TIAL



TO:

MATA Board of Commissioners

FROM:

Ron Garrison, President/General Manager

SUBJECT:

ORX Change Order for Truck Refurbishment/Repair

DATE:

**September 27, 2016** 

On April 27, 2015, The MATA Board approved a contract with ORX for refurbishment/repair of four trolley trucks with an option for 20 additional trucks.

Included in the contract was an allowance for "extra work' that might be needed on individual components. The extent of extra work would not be known until the trucks were received and dissembled by ORX. MATA gave a Notice to Proceed for four trucks, and ORX transported these to their company. ORX dissembled and assessed the condition of the trucks and individual components and provided MATA with a revised list of components that require repair, along with unit costs. The differences from the contract fall into the categories of:

- Not currently on the list
- Have multiple units that need to be replaced
- Have revised unit costs due to more extensive repair needed

ORX estimated the additional repair cost per truck to be \$17,426, and the Board authorized a change order in the amount of \$69,704 on September 24, 2015 for the four trucks. At that Board meeting, Staff stated that if MATA planned to have additional trucks repaired, these costs would also apply to them. After the change order was processed, ORX found additional work that was required, and Staff agreed that this work was necessary. This additional work included:

- Reconditioning Axle Bearing
- Replacing Elliptical Springs
- Replacing the Spring Plank
- Line-boring the Traction Motor
- Overhauling the Traction Motor Bearing Caps
- Aligning the Traction Motor Armature Pinion
- Replacing the Brake Linkage

The cost of this extra work was \$10,634/truck for a total of \$42,536. ORX has completed the work on the first four trucks, and they have been delivered and installed on two trolleys.

MINUTES OF 9/27/16 TENTIA

MATA has been selected by TDOT to receive a CMAQ grant for three trolleys, and we now need ORX to refurbish 12 more trucks so that six of the trucks can be supplied to the trolley refurbishment contractor with the other six being available for other trolleys in MATA's fleet. We are requesting Board approval to exercise the option of ORX refurbishing 12 more trucks. ORX has indicated that the extra costs associated with the first change order as well as the extra work totaling \$10,634/truck will be necessary for the 12 trucks.

Staff determined that eight of the thrust collars included in the first change order were not necessary, so we will received a credit for them. ORX has also informed MATA that two of the trucks will require suspension modification due to the weight of one of the trolleys.

The total cost of all the extra work for the 12 trucks (including the credit for the eight thrust collars on the first four trucks) will increase the contract by \$390,136 to a total of \$951,744. MATA's staff has determined that ORX's costs are fair and reasonable and recommends that the Board authorize a change order to cover the additional cost.

Let me know if you have questions.

MINUTES CF 9/27/16 ITEM VIA2

### MEMPHIS AREA TRANSIT AUTHORITY BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS

#### **RESOLUTION NO. 16-28**

### RESOLUTION TO AWARD A CONTRACT FOR TRANSIT MANAGEMENT SERVICES TO FIRST TRANSIT, INC.

WHEREAS, the Memphis Area Transit Authority (MATA) has a contract for Transit Management Services with First Transit, Inc. for management and operation of MATA's fixed route, demand response paratransit, and light rail vintage trolley system, the term of which has been extended; and

WHEREAS, MATA advertised and solicited proposals for a five (5) year contract in accordance with its procurement policy; and

WHEREAS, all Mid-South Transportation Management, Inc. (MTM) personnel were recused from evaluation of Proposals, selection of the recommended Proposer, award and communication with potential Proposers;

WHEREAS, three (3) Proposals were received and evaluated by the Evaluation Committee; and

WHEREAS, First Transit, Inc. was the highest rated proposer; and

WHEREAS, First Transit Inc. provided a cost proposal for fees of \$1,142,888 for the five (5) year term of the Contract, which has been determined to be reasonable; and

WHEREAS, First Transit Inc. shall report its DBE participation to MATA; and

WHEREAS, Staff recommends that a contract be awarded to First Transit Inc. for a cost of \$219,757 for Year 1, \$220,170 for Year 2, \$227,095 for Year 3, \$234,243 for Year 4 and \$241,623 for Year 5 for a total of \$1,142,888; together with 180 hours per year of support services included in the foregoing costs; and additional support services to be available to MATA at the costs set forth in the Cost Proposal.

NOW, THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED BY THE MEMPHIS AREA TRANSIT AUTHORITY BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS That a contract be awarded for Transit Management Services to First Transit Inc. for a period of five years in an amount of \$1,142,888.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the President/General Manager, Chairman and Vice-Chairman are authorized to execute the necessary documents.

\*\*\*\*\*\*

MINUTES OF 9/87/16 TO VIA 2

#### Res. No. 16-28

Motion Made By: John Vergos SE

SECONDED: Martin Lipinski

YEA: Sean Healy; Andre Gibson; John Vergos; Shelia Williams; Kristen Bland; Roquita

Coleman-Williams; Martin Lipinski; Lauren Taylor; Tommy Pacello

NAY: None

Approved: September 27, 2016

Absent at Time: NONE

MINUTES OF 9/27/16 TEN TIAD

NETWO

# Apperson Crump The Law in Memphis Since 1865

TO:

MATA BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS

FROM:

Bruce M. Smith, MATA General Counsel

DATE:

September 19, 2016

SUBJECT:

Transit Management Services Procurement (RFP No. 16-08)

As you know, all transit personnel (with the exception of the Senior Administrative Officer) are employees of Mid-South Transportation Management, Inc. (MTM), a subsidiary of the current contractor, First Transit Inc. Accordingly, MTM personnel cannot be involved in the procurement process due to a conflict of interest. MATA requested that I, as MATA General Counsel, conduct the tasks that would normally be handled by MATA's Purchasing Department and Staff (all such personnel being employed by MTM), beginning with tasks that occur after the release of the Request For Proposals (RFP).

In order to avoid any actual or potential conflict of interest, all MTM personnel were recused from communication with potential Proposers, evaluation of the Proposals and selection of a recommended contractor for award. This action was taken to comply with applicable Federal Transit Administration (FTA) requirements, and should not be viewed as a reflection on either MTM's procurement practices or MTM's performance.

The Request For Proposals was sent to seventeen vendors and formally advertised. MATA's website informed interested persons and firms to contact me for information and copies of the RFP. Three proposals were received: (1) First Transit, Inc., (2) McDonald Transit; and (3) MV Transportation, Inc.

There was a 0% DBE goal assigned to this procurement.

MATA's Evaluation Committee reviewed the three responsive and responsible proposals and discussed the findings based on the criteria set forth in the solicitation document. The following criteria with their point values were evaluated:

1. Transit Management Experience (including Client Satisfaction) - (40 points)

BRUCE M. SMITH
Direct Dial 901-260-5145
bimith@appersoncrump.com

APPERSON CRUMP PLC, ATTORNEYS AT LAW Memphia · Nashville

6070 Poplar Avenue, Suite 600, Memphis, TN 38119-3954 Tcl 901-756-6300 · Fax 901-757-1296

WINUTES OF 9/27/16 TENT VIA 2

 Availability and Expertise of Staff (including proposed on-site Transit Professional) – (30 points)

3. Price - (20 points)

4. Management Approach – (10 points)

Three (3) Proposals were received. Each contained a Technical Proposal and a Cost Proposal. After the Technical Proposals were scored by each Evaluation Committee Member, the Cost Proposals were evaluated and scored by each Evaluation Committee Member. The results are summarized below:

Proposer	Total Points	Total Cost (5 Years)
First Transit Inc.	280	\$1,142,888.00
McDonald Transit	201	\$1,148,286.00
MV Transportation Inc.	220	\$1,751,421.09

First Transit Inc. has confirmed that its Cost Proposal includes 180 hours of First Transit Customer Support Staff labor each contract year at no additional charge (exclusive of a sub-consultant).

McDonald Transit did not offer or provide staffing or hourly rates for Additional Services/Special Projects.

The Evaluation Committee recommends awarding a five-year contract to First Transit, Inc. at the rates shown below including hourly costs for labor rates and daily costs for equipment unless otherwise noted at a total cost not to exceed as follows:

	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 4	Year 5	TOTAL
BASE FEE						
Full-Time On- Site Professional	\$164,818	\$165,127	\$170,321	\$181,218	\$181,218	\$857,166
Home Office Support	\$54,939	\$55,043	\$56,774	\$58,561	\$60,406	\$285,722
TOTAL BASE FEE	\$219,757	\$220,170	\$227,095	\$234,243	\$241,623	\$1,142,888

The Base Fee includes 150 hours of First Transit Customer Support Staff labor each year at no additional charge. The Evaluation Committee evaluated the Proposal on the basis of 150 hours. First Transit confirmed that its Proposal includes 180 hours of First Transit Customer Support labor each year at no additional charge.

MRIUTES OF 9/27/16 TEM DIAS

First Transit will provide Additional Services/Special Projects at the following staffing hourly rates:

	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 4	Year 5	TOTAL
STAFFING (hourly rate)						
Senior Associate	\$125 <b>-\$</b> 215	\$125-\$215	\$125-\$215	\$125-\$215	\$125-\$215	\$125-\$215
Junior Associate	\$75-\$125	\$75-\$125	\$75-\$125	\$75-\$125	\$75-\$125	\$75-\$125
Clerical/Administrative Support	\$50	\$50	\$50	\$50	\$50	\$50

First Transit's Year 1 Base Fee computes to a monthly charge of \$18,313.08. The current monthly charge is \$17,900.00.



### MEMPHIS AREA TRANSIT AUTHORITY BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS

#### **RESOLUTION NO. 16-29**

### RESOLUTION TO EXTEND TERM OF APPOINTMENT OF RONALD L. GARRISON AS PRESIDENT/GENERAL MANAGER

WHEREAS, Section 2-56-5, Code Of Ordinances, City Of Memphis, Tennessee (City Code) authorizes the Memphis Area Transit Authority (MATA) Board Of Commissioners to hire or contract with a general manager to operate the MATA transportation system; and

WHEREAS, Ronald L. Garrison was appointed to the position of President/General Manager by Resolution 14-45; and

WHEREAS, the term of Mr. Garrison's appointment began on August 26, 2014 and the initial term thereof continues for three (3) years through and including August 25, 2017; and

WHEREAS, Ronald L. Garrison's tenure in Memphis, has been marked by distinguished service; and

WHEREAS, during Mr. Garrison's tenure and due largely to his efforts as President/General Manager, public transportation service in Memphis has improved, and major transit projects such as the development of Central Station, Main-To-Main Project and the initiative to move people to jobs and jobs to people have moved swiftly and efficiently forward; and

WHEREFORE, the MATA Board believes that it is MATA's and the public's best interest to extend the term of the appointment of Mr. Garrison as President/General Manager by an additional five (5) years from August 26, 2017, through and including August 25, 2022, to serve at the will and pleasure of the MATA Board; and

WHEREAS, Mr. Garrison will remain an employee of Mid-South Transportation Management, Inc. (MTM); and

WHEREAS, MTM has informed MATA as to the financial aspects of the extension of Mr. Garrison's appointment for purposes of MATA's budget; and

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED BY THE MEMPHIS AREA TRANSIT AUTHORITY BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS that the appointment of Ronald L. Garrison as President/General Manager be extended by five (5) years from August 26, 2017, through and including August 25, 2022, so that his appointment as President/General Manager as herein extended shall be effective through and including August 25, 2022. During this term, Mr. Garrison shall serve at the will and pleasure of the MATA Board of Commissioners.



BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Chairman is authorized and directed on behalf of the Board from time to time to establish working procedures, reporting procedures, administrative procedures, and guidelines to be followed by Mr. Garrison in his dealings with the Board and in the performance of his responsibilities as President/General Manager.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED That the Memphis Area Transit Authority Board of Commissioners ratifies, confirms and approves the terms and conditions negotiated by Sean Healy, Chairman, MATA Board Of Commissioners with Ronald L. Garrison as to his appointment as President/General Manager and reimbursement by MATA of the expense of and incident to Mr. Garrison's contract of employment with Mid-South Transportation Management, Inc.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED That the Chairman is authorized and directed to execute documents related to the extension of the term of the appointment of Ronald L. Garrison as MATA President/General Manager on behalf of the Authority and to take such actions on behalf of the Authority with Mid-South Transportation Management Inc. as are necessary and appropriate as to Mr. Garrison's employment with MTM.

\*\*\*\*\*\*

Motion Made By: Lauren Taylor SECONDED: Andre Gibson

YEA: Sean Healy; Andre Gibson; John Vergos; Shelia Williams; Kristen Bland; Roquita

Coleman-Williams; Martin Lipinski; Lauren Taylor; Tommy Pacello

NAY: None

Approved: September 27, 2016

Absent at Time: NONE

MENUTES OF 9/27/16 TEN VIAS



TO: MATA BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS

FROM: Sean L. Healy, Chairman,

**MATA Board of Commissioners** 

DATE: September 19, 2016

SUBJECT: RESOLUTION TO EXTEND TERM OF APPOINTMENT OF RONALD L. GARRISON AS PRESIDENT/GENERAL MANAGER

The MATA Board of Commissioners appointed Ron Garrison as President/General Manager by Resolution No. 14-45. The initial term of his appointment is August 26, 2014 through August 25, 2017.

The MATA Board provided Mr. Garrison with goals and objectives at the commencement of his appointment, and has conducted periodic performance reviews. During Mr. Garrison's tenure and due largely to his efforts as President/General Manager, public transportation service in Memphis has improved and progress is being made in developing and implementing MATA's Projects, such as the development of Central Station, the Main-to-Main Project, and the initiative to move people to jobs and jobs to people.

Given the long term nature of many of the initiatives MATA has underway, it is in MATA's and the public's best interest to extend the term of Mr. Garrison as President/General Manager by an additional five (5) years from August 26, 2017 through and including August 25, 2022, to serve at the will and pleasure of the MATA Board Of Commissioners.

Mr. Garrison will remain an employee of Mid-South Transportation Management, Inc. (MTM).

I recommend that the term of Ronald L. Garrison as MATA President/General Manager be extended by an additional five (5) years from August 26, 2017 through and including August 25, 2022, to serve at the will and pleasure of the MATA Board Of Commissioners.

MINUTES OF 9/87/16 TEM JAH

# MEMPHIS AREA TRANSIT AUTHORITY BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS

#### **RESOLUTION NO. 16-30**

# RESOLUTION TO EXTEND THE TERM AND INCREASE THE AMOUNT OF THE ON-CALL CONTRACT WITH SHELBY ELECTRIC COMPANY FOR RAIL SYSTEM AND FACILITY ELECTRICAL SERVICES

WHEREAS, The Memphis Area Transit Authority (MATA) has a five-year oncall contract with Shelby Electric Company for providing rail system and facility electrical services that expires September 30, 2016; and

WHEREAS, MATA's Staff solicited proposals for a new five-year on-call contract for rail system and facility electrical services and only received one proposal which was deemed non-responsive; and

WHEREAS, MATA plans to resolicit for this project with a proposed Board approval date of January 24, 2017; and

WHEREAS, During the interim period, MATA needs the services of a qualified company to perform various electrical work on the rail system and vehicles in order for MATA to be able to restart trolley service in a timely manner; and

WHEREAS, Staff is satisfied with Shelby Electric Company's work and hourly rates and recommends that the term of their contract be extended through February 28, 2017 at the same hourly rates; and

WHEREAS, Staff also recommends that the contract amount be increased by \$550,000 to cover necessary repairs to the rail system and vehicles; and

WHEREAS, Capital funds are available for the electrical work under this extension.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED BY THE MEMPHIS AREA TRANSIT AUTHORITY BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS That the on-call contract with Shelby Electric Company for providing rail system and facility electrical services is extended to February 28, 2017 with the contract amount being increased by \$550,000.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED That the Contracting Officer, the Chief Executive Officer or Chief Administrative Officer be authorized to execute any necessary documents.

\*\*\*\*\*

MINUTES OF 937/16 TENTAL

#### Res. No. 16-30

Motion Made By: John Vergos SECONDED: Andre Gibson

YEA: Sean Healy; Andre Gibson; John Vergos; Shelia Williams; Kristen Bland; Roquita

Coleman-Williams; Martin Lipinski; Lauren Taylor; Tommy Pacello

NAY: None

Approved: September 27, 2016

Absent at Time: NONE





TO:

**MATA Board of Commissioners** 

FROM:

Ronald L. Garrison, Chief Executive Officer

**SUBJECT:** 

Extension and Increase in Authorized Amount of On-Call Contract

with Shelby Electric for Providing Rail System and Facility Electrical

Services

DATE:

**September 27, 2016** 

MATA's five-year on-call contract with Shelby Electric Company for providing rail system and facility electrical services expires on September 30, 2016. MATA's staff solicited proposals for another five-year contract and planned on the contract being awarded at this Board meeting; however, only one proposal was received, and it was deemed non-responsive due to the proposer not meeting the DBE goal. MATA's staff plans to re-solicit for this project with an expected Board award on January 24, 2017.

In the interim period, MATA continues to need the services of Shelby Electric for electrical work associated with the trolley system in order to have the system ready when the trolley system is placed back in revenue service. There are several projects involving electrical work that must be started between now and January 24, 2017. The projects and their estimated budget include:

Repair Traction Power Substation at Trolley Facility	\$129,000
Rehabilitate and Re-tension Catenary System on Main Street	140,000
Improve Communications for Traction Power Substation	10,000
Install Over Height Vehicle Detection and Warning System	106,000
Rewire W-2 Melbourne Trolley	165,000
TOTAL	\$550,000

Staff is recommending that the Board authorize an extension of Shelby Electric's contract to February 28, 2017 and increase the dollar threshold of the contract by \$550,000.

Let me know if you have questions.

MINUTES OF 9/27/16 TEM VIBI

## MEMPHIS AREA TRANSIT AUTHORITY BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS

#### **RESOLUTION NO. 16-31**

# RESOLUTION TO AWARD A CONTRACT TO MID-SOUTH BUS SALES FOR THE PURCHASE OF 10 WHEELCHAIR-ACCESSIBLE VANS

WHEREAS, The Memphis Area Transit Authority (MATA) is the designated recipient of Section 5310 funds for Enhanced Mobility of Seniors and Persons with Disabilities in the Tennessee portion of the Memphis Urbanized Area; and

WHEREAS, This procurement is the result of a Request for Proposals issued by MATA soliciting projects to be funded under the Section 5310 program as approved by the MATA Board of Commissioners in Resolution No. 16-04; and

WHEREAS, MATA solicited proposals from vendors for purchasing up to 10 wheelchair-accessible vans to be used by Checker Cab Company for taxi service; and

WHEREAS, Proposals for the vans (seven rear-entry and three side-entry) were solicited in accordance with MATA's Procurement Policies including formal advertisement; and

WHEREAS, Four proposals were received with four of them proposing to provide both rear-entry and side-entry vans and one of them proposing to provide only side-entry vans; and

WHEREAS, MATA's Evaluation Committee has reviewed the proposals received and recommends that a contract be awarded to Mid-South bus Sales for the purchase of seven rear-entry wheelchair-accessible vans at a price of \$34,265 each and three side-entry wheelchair-accessible vans at a price of \$36,684 each for a total of \$349,907.

WHEREAS, MATA has funds available for the Federal (80%) and State (10%) shares of this project with Checker Cab Company providing the 10% local match for the 10 vans.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED BY THE MEMPHIS AREA TRANSIT AUTHORITY BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS, That a contract be awarded to Mid-South Bus Sales for the purchase of seven rear-entry wheelchair-accessible vans at a price of \$34,265 each and three side-entry wheelchair-accessible vans at a price of \$36,684 each for a total of \$349,907.

MINUTES OF 927/16 TEM VIBI

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, That Checker Cab Company shall provide the 10% local share for their 10 vans and enter into a lease with MATA for the vehicles.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED That the Chief Executive Officer, Chief Administrative Officer, Chairman or Vice-Chairman be authorized to execute the necessary contract.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED That Checker Cab shall use its best efforts to have at least one of their wheelchair-accessible taxis available for passengers requiring wheelchair assistance 24-hours a day.

\*\*\*\*\*\*

Motion Made By: John Vergos SECONDED: Lauren Taylor

YEA: Sean Healy; Andre Gibson; John Vergos; Shelia Williams; Kristen Bland; Roquita

Coleman-Williams; Martin Lipinski; Lauren Taylor; Tommy Pacello

NAY: None

Approved: September 27, 2016

Absent at Time: NONE

MINUTES OF 9/27/14 IN ITBI



TO:

**MATA Board of Commissioners** 

FROM:

Ronald L. Garrison, Chief Executive Officer

SUBJECT:

Purchase of 10 Wheelchair-Accessible Vans

DATE:

September 27, 2016

MATA has funds in a Section 5310 Enhance Mobility for Seniors and Persons with Disabilities grant to purchase 10 wheelchair-accessible vans. Resolution 16-04 authorized MATA to purchase 10 vans for Checker Cab to use as wheelchair-accessible taxis.

Due to previous requests from persons with disabilities, MATA's staff decided that at least three of the vans should be side-loading vans with the remaining seven being rear-loading vans. MATA solicited proposals for the wheelchair-accessible vans and received four proposals. Three of the proposers (Central States Bus Sales, Mid-South Bus Center and National Bus Sales) proposed to provide both types of vans. Transit Works only proposed to provide the side-loading vans.

All of the vans will have the capacity to transport two passengers in wheelchairs with two ambulatory passengers. If only one wheelchair is in use, four ambulatory passengers can be transported besides the passenger in the wheelchair. If no wheelchairs are in use, the vehicle can transport a maximum of six ambulatory passengers. The ramp will support 800 pounds which exceeds the ADA's 600-pound threshold.

MATA's Evaluation Committee evaluated the proposals in accordance with the evaluation criteria in the Request for Proposals. The proposers could receive a total of 500 points, and the results of the evaluation are as follows:

Proposer	Points for Rear-Entry Vans	Points for Side-Entry Vans
Central States Bus Sales	415	420
Mid-South Bus Center	443	448
National Bus Sales	440	440
Transit Works	439	N/A

MINUTES OF GLOTILLE VIBI

The cost per van and the delivery times for each of the proposers are:

Central States Bus Sales	\$36,937.00 (Rear Entry) \$39,862.00 (Side Entry)	Delivery time: 120 days
Mid-South Bus Center	\$34,265.00 (Rear Entry) \$36,684.00 (Side Entry)	Delivery time: 60 days
National Bus Sales	\$34,745.00 (Rear Entry) \$39,109.00 (Side Entry)	Delivery time: 120 days
TransitWorks	\$32,700.00 (Rear Entry)	Delivery time: 135 days

Federal Section 5310 funds will cover 80% of the vans' cost with TDOT providing another 10%. Checker Cab has stated that they will provide the 10% local match for the 10 vans.

The Evaluation Committee recommends that a contract be awarded to Mid-South Bus Sales for the purchase of seven rear-entry vans at a price of \$34,265 each and three side-entry vans at a price of \$36,684 each for a total cost of \$349,907. The price of the proposed vans was determined to be fair and reasonable.

Please let me know if you have questions or would like to discuss.

MINUTES OF 9/27/16 TEN VIIB 2

# MEMPHIS AREA TRANSIT AUTHORITY BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS

#### **RESOLUTION NO. 16-32**

## RESOLUTION TO EXTEND LEASE OF VEHICLES FROM CREATIVE BUS SALES FOR MATAPLUS SERVICE

WHEREAS, The Memphis Area Transit Authority (MATA) continues to have a need for additional vehicles for MATAPlus service; and

WHEREAS, MATA leased 15 vans from Creative Bus Sales in June, 2015 for a year until 12 new MATAPlus buses were received; and

WHEREAS, The 12 new MATAPlus buses were not put into revenue service until late August and early September, 2016; and

WHEREAS, Staff has determined that there is still a need to continue leasing six of the vans from Creative Bus Sales until additional MATAPlus vehicles are received; and

WHEREAS, The cost for leasing the 15 vans for the months of July – September, 2016 has been \$76,500; and

WHEREAS, The cost for leasing the six vans from Creative Bus Sales through May 31, 2017 will be \$96,000; and

WHEREAS, The total cost for leasing the buses in FY17 has exceeded \$50,000 which requires approval from the MATA Board; and

WHEREAS, Staff recommends that the MATA Board approve extending the lease to cover the period of June 26, 2015 – May 31, 2017 and the cost for the FY17 expenses totaling \$172,500; and

WHEREAS, Operating funds are available for this project.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED BY THE MEMPHIS AREA TRANSIT AUTHORITY BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS That the lease with Creative Bus Sales for vans for MATAPlus service is extended to cover the period of June 26, 2015 – May 31, 2017 and the cost for the FY17 expenses totaling \$172,500.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED That the Chief Executive Officer or the Chief Administrative Officer be authorized to execute any necessary documents.

\* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \*

MINUTES OF 9/27/16 TEN VIBA

#### Res. No. 16-32

Motion Made By: John Vergos SECONDED: Andre Gibson

YEA: Sean Healy; Andre Gibson; John Vergos; Shelia Williams; Kristen Bland; Roquita

Coleman-Williams; Martin Lipinski; Lauren Taylor; Tommy Pacello

NAY: None

Approved: September 27, 2016

Absent at Time: NONE





TO: The MATA Board of Commissioners

FROM: Ronald L. Garrison, Chief Executive Officer (CEO)

DATE: September 27, 2016

SUBJECT: Lease of 15 Vans from Creative Bus Sales for MATAPlus Service

In June, 2015, MATA's Staff determined that it would be in MATA's best interest to lease 15 vans from Creative Bus Sales for three months to help meet service demands for MATAPlus service. Each van's monthly cost was \$1,000, so the total monthly cost was \$15,000 with the total cost over the three-month period being \$45,000. MATA continued to use the vans while 12 MATAPlus buses were on order, and the cost for the lease exceeded \$50,000 which required Board approval. The Board authorized an extension of the lease until June 30, 2016 and approved the extra cost for this extension which totaled \$180,000.

The 12 new buses arrived in late June, but MATA was unable to put them into revenue service until August 23 – September 6, 2016. This resulted in the need to continue leasing the vans from Creative Bus Sales through September 6<sup>th</sup>. The cost for leasing the vans between July 1 and September 30, 2016 was \$76,500.

MATA's staff is now recommending that we continue leasing six of the vans to help with MATAPlus demands until May 31, 2017. This will help assure that MATA has sufficient vehicles needed for service as MATA transitions buses from the MATAPlus fleet into the fixed-route fleet.

The cost of leasing the six vans for the period of October 1, 2016 – May 31, 2017 will be \$96,000, and MATA's Staff is requesting the Board to approve extending the lease for six of the vans through May 31, 2017 and approve the FY17 costs totaling \$172,500 for all the vans.

Let me know if you have questions.

WHATES OF 9/27/16 TEM VIB3

# MEMPHIS AREA TRANSIT AUTHORITY BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS

#### **RESOLUTION NO. 16-33**

#### RESOLUTION TO APPROVE SERVICE CHANGES

WHEREAS, MATA makes service changes periodically in order to increase efficiency and effectiveness of service and to align service levels with available funding; and

WHEREAS, The proposed set of service changes was made available for public comment by posting notices in the Daily News, Tri-State Defender, and the La Prensa Latina, and posted on MATA's website and at transit centers; and

WHEREAS, open house meetings were held on Thursday, August 25, 2016, at Airways Transit Center and a formal Public Hearing was held Tuesday, August 30, 2016, at Central Station to provide riders and citizens an opportunity to submit comments in addition to the normal public comment period; and

WHEREAS, Comments from riders and citizens in the community have been considered; and

WHEREAS, Staff recommends that the changes summarized below be approved for fixed route bus service:

Express Trips on Route 40 will become the Route 400 Wolfchase. No proposed routing or timing changes.

Minor timing adjustments to make better connections between routes and/or improve on-time performance: Routes 7, 9, 19, 21, 22, 26, 28, 32, 37, 42, and 50.

Minor timing adjustments to accommodate route adjustments: Routes 2, 4, 8, 11, and 40.

Schedule adjustments to the following routes:

6 Northaven - Discontinue underutilized Saturday service.

26 Hickory Hill - An additional westbound trip added on Sundays at 7:30 a.m. to provide earlier service and connection to AWTC.

- 46 Whitehaven Adjust service to every 120 minutes 5 a.m. to 10 a.m. and 1:30 p.m. to 6:45 p.m.
- 53 Summer In order to simplify service, trips and times will be adjusted so that each inbound trip follows the same routing variation as its corresponding outbound trip.
- 99 Nonconnah Adjust service to every 60 minutes to make service more productive.

#### Routing adjustments to the following routes:

- 2 Madison Discontinue service between Airways Transit Center and Airport. Replacement service from Airways Transit Center to the Airport provided by new Route 64 Airport Shuttle.
- 4 Walker Discontinue service between Airways Transit Center and the Airport on Night and Sunday trips. Replacement service to the Airport and to Democrat Rd is provided by new Route 64 Airport Shuttle.
- 8 Chelsea Extend route east along Chelsea to serve Douglas High School. Turn around at N Holmes >> Mt Olive >> Ash >> Chelsea, and continue west along current path.
- 11 Thomas Adjust outbound service from Hudson Transit Center (HTC): A.W. Willis >> N 2nd >> Whitney, then continues along current path of Route 11 to Austin Peay, and return inbound along opposite path. Change name to 11 N 2<sup>nd</sup> / Raleigh
- 40 Wolfchase Discontinue service along Jackson and Hollywood and adjust outbound service on these trips to Shadyac >> N 2nd >> Chelsea >> Danny Thomas >> Stage/Delano/James, then continue along current path of Route 40 to Wolfchase and follow opposite path inbound. Discontinued portions along Jackson and Hollywood are served by Routes 52 and 32. No change to express trips that operate on I-240.

#### **New Routes:**

44 Goodlett Farms - New feeder route will operate eastbound via State >> Mullins Station >> Macon >> Century Center >> Goodlett Farms >> Appling >> Dexter >> Germantown Pkwy >> IKEA Way >> Germantown Pkwy, then turn around at Stage >> Wolfcreek>> Germantown Pkwy and return eastbound along opposite path. Weekday service provided every 60 minutes 8 a.m. - 6 p.m.

47 Shelby Farms Park - New feeder will provide shuttle service between Shelby Farms Greenline, Shelby Farms Park, and the

Agricenter Farmer's Market. Will operate eastbound via State >> Mullins Station >> Farm >> North >> Pine Lake W >> Woodland Discovery Playground >> Pine Lake W >> North >> Event Center >> Walnut Grove >> Germantown Pkwy >> Moore, then turn around at Moore >> Belz View >> Timber Creek >> Germantown Pkwy and return westbound along opposite path. Saturday and Sunday service is provided every 45 minutes 9 a.m. - 6 p.m.

64 Airport Shuttle - New route will operate westbound from AWTC via American Way >> Tchulahoma >> Democrat >> Airways >> ATC >> Airways >> Winchester >> Plough >> Memphis International Airport, and return eastbound along opposite path. Weekday service is provided every 45 minutes 5-9 a.m. and 3-6 p.m. every 60 minutes 9 a.m. - 3 p.m. and 6-11 p.m. Saturday and Sunday service every 60 minutes 7 a.m. - 6 p.m.

WHEREAS, The recommended changes are consistent with the goals and recommendations of the Transit Plan adopted by the MATA Board of Commissioners on March 24, 2014; and

WHEREAS, The proposed changes have been reviewed according to MATA's adopted Title VI policies and a service equity analysis was performed to determine whether the proposed changes would have adverse effects, potential disparate impacts, or disproportionate burdens to minority or low-income populations; and

WHEREAS, The results of the service equity analysis has determined that any adverse effects, potential disparate impacts, or disproportionate burdens to minority or low-income populations associated with these proposed service changes are within the limits of board adopted policies for disparate impacts and disproportionate burdens adopted on March 25, 2013; and

WHEREAS, Staff recommends said changes be effective on December 11, 2016.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED BY THE MEMPHIS AREA TRANSIT AUTHORITY BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS That the service changes are approved to be effective December 11, 2016.

\* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \* \*

MINUTES OF 9 27/16 ITEM VIR3

# Res. No. 16-33

Motion Made By: Kristen Bland SECONDED: Martin Lipinski

YEA: Sean Healy; Andre Gibson; John Vergos; Shelia Williams; Kristen Bland; Roquita

Coleman-Williams; Martin Lipinski; Lauren Taylor; Tommy Pacello

NAY: None

Approved: September 27, 2016

Absent at Time: NONE





TO:

**MATA Board of Commissioners** 

FROM:

Ron Garrison, Chief Executive Officer

SUBJECT:

Summary of Proposed Service Changes and Public Outreach for

**Proposed December 2016 Service Improvements** 

DATE:

**September 26, 2016** 

The proposed service changes in the accompanying resolution are designed to make adjustments to routes and schedules on certain bus routes to go into effect on December 11, 2016. These changes will add about \$550,000 in additional bus service. Schedule and routing changes are consistent with recommendations from the adopted transit plan.

The primary objectives of the proposed service improvements are:

- Implement the adopted transit plan
- Provide adequate service with available funding
- Improve cost efficiency and productivity of the system
- Improve on-time performance
- Increase ridership
- Respond to public input

MATA conducted a wide range of public outreach to gather input about the proposed service changes. Outreach was offered by:

- Two public meetings
- Advertisements in the Daily News, Tri-State Defender, and La Prensa Latina
- Notice on MATA's website and social media
- Printed materials at all transit centers

#### MATA received 33 public comments via:

- Oral comments at public meetings (21)
- Written comments at public meetings (5)
- E-mails (4)
- Social Media (1)
- Letters to MATA via U.S. mail (2)

All comments were reviewed and considered. A summary of the comments was as follows:



# **General Comments:**

- MATA should increase the number of community meetings in local communities to provide greater outreach to customers
- Provide more detailed draft schedules of the proposed changes
- Provide more service in the core of the city, particularly in communities such as Crosstown, New Chicago, and Riverview
- The frequent number of bus service changes make it difficult for customers and require them to adjust their work schedules
- · Provide more service later on weekdays and on weekends
- · Provide more park-n-ride service to outlying areas, such as Millington
- Extend trolley service south to Carolina Avenue
- Provide more shuttle service for special events, such as the Grizzlies games

## Related to Proposed Changes:

- Route 2 Concerns that shortening Route 2 to end service at Airways Blvd.
  would not provide direct service to the Airways Transit Center and Airport,
  would require customers to transfer in areas with limited security and would
  increase the number of transfers for customers
- Route 12 Concerns about timed transfers on between buses for routes replacing service on portions of Route 12
- Route 30 Concerns that replacement service in some areas would be inadequate and that Route 37's lack of Saturday service does not replace Route 30's Saturday trips on Perkins from American Way Transit Center to Oak Court Mall
- Route 36 Concerns that inadequate service will be provided in areas of Lamar and Knight Arnold and customers will have to wait for transfers in areas without adequate security or facilities
- Route 56 Concerns that if re-routed off of union, there will be no service before 6 am along the and that employees will be negatively impacted by the proposed changes
- Route 69 Concerns that areas will not be adequately served and that proposed routing will require additional transfers

As a result, staff is recommending the following revisions to the service change proposal that was originally published:

Proposed routing changes to Routes 7, 12, 30, 36, 38, 39, 42, 56, 57, and 69 will be postponed until concerns can be better addressed. New service on Routes 45, 280, and 340 will be postponed until next spring.

The transcript from the Public Hearing and a summary of other comments is available for review.

Please let me know if you have questions or would like to discuss.

MINUTES OF 9 DITILO ITEM VIB3



TO: MATA Board of Commissioners

FROM: Ronald Garrison, Chief Executive Officer

DATE: September 22, 2016

RE: Title VI Service Equity Analysis for Proposed December 2016 Route

and Service Changes

As required by Federal Transit Administration (FTA) circular 4702.1B, MATA staff has conducted a Title VI Service Equity Analysis for the proposed December 2016 route and service changes to determine the impact of the proposed service changes on minority and low income populations. FTA requires recipients such as MATA to evaluate significant system-wide service changes and proposed improvements at the planning and programming stages to determine whether those changes have a discriminatory impact.

MATA's Board of Commissioners adopted a new Major Service Change Policy, Disparate Impact Policy, and Low-Income Burden Policy on March 25, 2013. The proposed route modifications and service changes proposed for the December 2016 sign-up qualify as a major service change with proposed changes to seven (7) bus routes and addition of three (3) new bus routes, which exceeds the criteria set forth in the adopted Major Service Change Policy. Therefore, the following Service Equity Analysis has been conducted to assess potential adverse impacts to populations protected by the provisions of Title VI.

#### **Definitions**

Minority: The FTA defines a minority person as one who self-identifies as American Indian/Alaska Native, Asian, Black or African American, Hispanic or Latino, and/or Native Hawaiian/Pacific Islander. The minority percentage for the MATA service area is 70.0% as illustrated in Table 1: Service Area Population Data for Proposed Changes.

Low Income: The FTA defines a low-income individual as one whose household income is at or below the poverty guidelines set by the Department of Health and Human Services (DHHS). DHHS poverty thresholds are based on household size and income, and are nearly identical to the guidelines used to define poverty in the

MINUTES OF 9 27/16 ITEM VIB3

2009-13 U.S. American Community Survey (ACS), which form the basis of this review. The low-Income percentage for this analysis is listed in Table 1: Service Area Population Data for Proposed Changes.

Disproportionate Burden: The FTA defines "disproportionate burden" as a neutral policy or practice that disproportionately affects low-income populations more than non-low-income populations. A finding of disproportionate burden requires the recipient to evaluate alternatives and mitigate burdens where practicable.

This analysis uses quantitative assessments to determine whether disproportionate burdens exist. In this analysis, if the quantitative results indicate that the proposed service changes creates adverse effects for low-income populations greater than 20 percent of those adverse effects borne by the non-low-income populations, that impact would be considered a disproportionate burden.

Disparate Impact: The FTA defines "disparate impact" as a facially neutral policy or practice that disproportionately affects members of a group identified by race, color, or national origin, where the recipient's policy or practice lacks a substantial legitimate justification and where there exists one or more alternatives that would serve the same legitimate justification and where there exists one or more alternatives that would serve the same legitimate objectives but with less disproportionate effect on the basis of race, color, or national origin.

This analysis uses quantitative assessments to determine whether disparate impacts exist. In this analysis, if the quantitative results indicate that the proposed service changes creates adverse effects for a minority population greater than 20 percent of those adverse effects borne by the non-minority population, that impact would be considered a disparate impact.

## Service Area Population

The "MATA Service Area" population data, as shown in Table 1 on the following page, is the total population in the MATA service area as defined by populations living within ¾-miles of fixed-route service and geographical defined areas such as the City of Memphis that MATA is authorized to provide service within as derived from 2009-13 ACS data. All population figures have been calculated with the assistance of Remix, an interactive transit planning program. The minority and low-income population percentages for the "MATA Service Area" have been determined by subtracting the white, non-Hispanic population from the total population in the census block groups within the area.

Table 1: Service Area Population Data for Proposed Changes					
Service Area	<b>Total</b> Population	Minority Population	Percent Minority	Low- Income Population	Percent Low-Income
MATA Service Area	737,227	516,354	70.0%	187,753	25.5%

13 Merris 91 9/87/16 TEA TEB 3

### **Evaluation Methodology**

The impacts of the proposed service changes on residents in the service area have been determined based on the potential change in the number of people with access to transit multiplied by the number of trips the potential service makes in a year. This equation creates a statistic known as "people-trips" to measure changes in service. Access to transit is measured by the population living within ¼-mile of the fixed-route bus service's path and ¼-mile within rail trolley service. The change in population served is assessed using a buffer of each route created by Remix. The change in the service level for minority and low-income groups is calculated through the change in minority and low-income people-trips. These people-trips are estimated by the change in the percentage of population that is minority and/or low-income within the ¼-mile area around the bus line and the change in annual trips for each routes.

The change in people-trips for minority and low-income population is compared with the change in people-trips for the whole population. These changes are tallied for all of MATA's fixed-route bus lines to determine if minority and low-income populations face a substantially greater change in people-trips than the population as a whole. The average percentage of low-income and minority populations were also calculated across the service area and the change in populations from the potential shifts in service area. The changes in service are then compared through the change between the impact on the entire area and the impact created on low-income and minority populations.

#### **Evaluation Results**

Table 2: Summary of Change in People-Trips					
	Minority	Low-	Total		
		Income	Population		
Change in People- Trips	55,352,105	16,675,949	84,715,280		
% Change Borne By	65.3%	19.7%	100%		

Table 3: Impact on Minority and Low-Income					
Minority Low-Incom					
% Change Borne By	65.3%	19.7%			
% of MATA Service Area	70.0%	25.5%			
Pop.					
Delta (Specific Impact)	-4.7%	-5.8%			

The results of the Title VI analysis find that the estimated number of people-trips is expected to increase by over 84 million. The number of people-trips by minority populations is expected to increase by over 55 million and low-income populations

MINUTER OF 9/27/16 TEM TIB3

by over 16 million. This amount is a slightly smaller proportion of the increase in people-trips than the minority share of the service area's population, which accounts for a -4.7% impact or change. The low-income population had an impact or change of -5.8%. Both analyses reflect disbenefits to minority and low-income populations, but both are within the limits of MATA's Board adopted policies. Neither of these results features an adverse or negative impact of greater than 20 percent. Thus, the service changes result in neither a disparate impact nor a disproportionate burden upon populations protected under Title VI of the Civil Rights Act of 1964.

We have used our adverse effects definition to review the service changes against our disproportionate burden and disparate impact policies and the proportion of low-income and minorities with access to transit routes to determine that there are no disparate impacts or disproportionate burdens to minority or low-income populations.

Based on this analysis, MATA has demonstrated that it has a substantial and legitimate justification for the proposed service changes.

MINITES OF 9/27/LOTEM TIBS

# **APPENDIX:**Title VI Service Equity Analysis

		Befo	ro	
	Population	Delc	, e	
	(within 1/4	Low		Trips
Route	mi)	Income	Minority	(Annually)
02 Madison	19,454	36.2%	62.9%	7,640
04 Walker A	16,643	45.9%	89.3%	4,575
04 Walker B	17,305	41.7%	92.0%	4,320
04 Walker C	20,183	39.0%	92.6%	2,410
05 Central	19,884	25.7%	41.6%	2,550
06 Northaven	10,496	48.0%	88.8%	2,625
07 Air Park	23,645	35.5%	83.9%	3,390
08 Chelsea	7,814	42.0%	96.8%	9,700
09 Highland	21,821	35.6%	67.6%	1,440
11 Thomas	24,393	40.1%	89.6%	7,420
12 Florida	17,701	30.7%	89.9%	4,210
13 Lauderdale	10,208	37.2%	84.6%	3,045
17 McLemore	20,239	40.0%	96.9%	4,450
18 Hawkins Mill	12,575	42.2%	92.6%	7,550
19 Vollintine	27,393	37.3%	76.5%	3,955
21 Mt Moriah	26,401	27.9%	75.3%	2,260
22 Raines	14,604	27.8%	95.0%	1,240
26 Hickory Hill	28,888	24.6%	91.3%	2,755
28 Holmes	9,595	33.2%	94.1%	2,425
30 Brooks	8,766	35.3%	55.9%	4,410
32 East Parkway /				
Hollywood	19,865	41.8%	85.7%	4,920
34 Walnut Grove	22,277	23.3%	41.1%	2,935
35 South Parkway	24,601	32.6%	68.6%	3,315
36 Hacks Cross	39,148	33.9%	86.3%	6,980
37 Perkins	17,321	26.2%	50.7%	2,550
38 Boxtown	9,404	32.0%	99.2%	3,555
39 South Third	17,364	31.1%	90.5%	8,115
40 Wolfchase	19,257	21.6%	58.2%	5,070
40 Wolfchase A	0			0
40 Wolfchase B	0			0
40 Wolfchase C	0			0
42 Crosstown	31,751	34.2%	87.2%	11,160
44 Goodlett Farms	•			
(new route) 46 Whitehaven	0	0= 00/	00.00/	0
46 Whitenaven 47 Shelby Farms Park	20,273	35.8%	86.0%	1,785
(new route)	0			0
50 Poplar	24,264	22.5%	39.6%	14,110
52 Jackson	18,768	31.9%	78.8%	12,560
53 Summer	26,541	27.9%	61.4%	8,020
	,	, ,	T.1.170	0,020

CONTRES OF 9 1/16 TEM VIB3

56 Lamar	26,445	37.7%	74.9%	9,755
57 Park	30,639	35.4%	71.3%	7,460
64 Airport Shuttle				
(new route)	0			0
69 Winchester	26,153	28.1%	96.8%	4,940
77 West Memphis	15,133	36.8%	69.3%	3,825
78 West Memphis Express	5,665	41.4%	69.5%	1,020
82 Germantown	10,769	7.1%	33.8%	1,275
98 W Memphis Green	2,080	48.1%	83.5%	1,860
99 Nonconnah	1,548	35.5%	97.7%	6,120
100 Trolley Main Line	3,308	28.7%	58.4%	22,420
101 Trolley Riverfront	3,487	28.3%	57.1%	13,340
102 Trolley Madison Line	5,393	45.7%	75.2%	13,490
All Changes	412,715	30.2%	75.3%	252,950

	After			
Paula	Population (within 1/4	Low		Trips
Route	mi)	Income	Minority	(Annually)
02 Madison	19,240	36.3%	62.5%	7,640
04 Walker A	16,643	45.9%	89.3%	4,575
04 Walker B	17,305	41.7%	92.0%	4,320
04 Walker C	18,827	42.1%	92.3%	2,410
05 Central	19,884	25.7%	41.6%	2,550
06 Northaven	10,496	48.0%	88.8%	2,295
07 Air Park	23,645	35.5%	83.9%	3,390
08 Chelsea	8,217	41.6%	97.0%	9,700
09 Highland	21,821	35.6%	67.6%	1,440
11 Thomas	25,519	39.2%	88.1%	7,420
12 Florida	17,701	30.7%	89.9%	4,210
13 Lauderdale	10,208	37.2%	84.6%	3,045
17 McLemore	20,239	40.0%	96.9%	4,450
18 Hawkins Mill	12,575	42.2%	92.6%	7,550
19 Vollintine	27,393	37.3%	76.5%	3,955
21 Mt Moriah	26,401	27.9%	75.3%	2,260
22 Raines	14,604	27.8%	95.0%	1,240
26 Hickory Hill	28,888	24.6%	91.3%	3,265
28 Holmes	9,595	33.2%	94.1%	2,425
30 Brooks 32 East Parkway /	8,766	35.3%	55.9%	4,410
Hollywood	19,865	41.8%	85.7%	4,920
34 Walnut Grove	22,277	23.3%	41.1%	2,935
35 South Parkway	24,601	32.6%	68.6%	3,315
36 Hacks Cross	39,148	33.9%	86.3%	6,980

LANGUES OF 9/27/16 TEN VIB3

37 Perkins	17,321	26.2%	50.7%	2,550
38 Boxtown	9,404	32.0%	99.2%	3,555
39 South Third	17,364	31.1%	90.5%	8,115
40 Wolfchase	0			0
40 Wolfchase A	19,257	21.6%	58.2%	1,020
40 Wolfchase B	21,828	23.1%	60.4%	3,315
40 Wolfchase C	19,970	24.8%	63.2%	2,010
42 Crosstown	31,751	34.2%	87.2%	11,160
44 Goodlett Farms	44-4-			
(new route)	11,745	8.0%	57.1%	2,550
46 Whitehaven 47 Shelby Farms Park	20,273	35.8%	86.0%	1,530
(new route)	2,953	8.7%	64.9%	1,320
50 Poplar	24,264	22.5%	39.6%	14,110
52 Jackson	18,768	31.9%	78.8%	12,560
53 Summer	26,541	27.9%	61.4%	8,020
56 Lamar	26,445	37.7%	74.9%	9,755
57 Park	30,639	35.4%	71.3%	7,460
64 Airport Shuttle				
(new route)	1,163	39.5%	91.3%	6,565
69 Winchester	26,153	28.1%	96.8%	4,940
77 West Memphis	15,133	36.8%	69.3%	3,825
78 West Memphis Express	5,665	41.4%	69.5%	1,020
82 Germantown	10,769	7.1%	33.8%	1,275
98 W Memphis Green	2,080	48.1%	83.5%	1,860
99 Nonconnah	1,548	35.5%	97.7%	3,060
100 Trolley Main Line	3,308	28.7%	58.4%	22,420
101 Trolley Riverfront	3,487	28.3%	57.1%	13,340
102 Trolley Madison Line	5,393	45.7%	75.2%	13,490
All Changes	424,110	30.0%	75.0%	261,525

MINUTES OF 9/20/16 TEM VIB3

	Difference				
				Change	
	People-Trips	1 1	B.82	Borne By	Change
Route	(Population * Trips)	Low Income People-Trips	Minority People-Trips	Low Income	Borne by Minorities
02 Madison	-1,634,960	-470,978	-1,596,760	28.8%	97.7%
04 Walker A	0	0	0	0.0%	0.0%
04 Walker B	0	0	0	0.0%	0.0%
04 Walker C	-3,267,960	99,721	-3,145,050	-3.1%	96.2%
05 Central	0	0	0	0.0%	0.0%
06 Northaven	-3,463,680	-1,662,500	-3,074,280	48.0%	88.8%
07 Air Park	0	0	0	0.0%	0.0%
08 Chelsea	3,909,100	1,337,451	3,889,700	34.2%	99.5%
09 Highland	0	0	0	0.0%	0.0%
11 Thomas	8,354,920	1,741,903	4,659,760	20.8%	55.8%
12 Florida	0	0	0	0.0%	0.0%
13 Lauderdale	0	0	0	0.0%	0.0%
17 McLemore	0	0	0	0.0%	0.0%
18 Hawkins Mill	0	0	0	0.0%	0.0%
19 Vollintine	0	0	0	0.0%	0:0%
21 Mt Moriah	0	0	0	0.0%	0.0%
22 Raines	0	0	0	0.0%	0.0%
26 Hickory Hill	14,732,880	3,623,939	13,447,170	24.6%	91.3%
28 Holmes	0	0	0	0.0%	0.0%
30 Brooks	0	0	0	0.0%	0.0%
32 East Parkway /	-	-	· ·	7	
Hollywood	0	0	0	0.0%	0.0%
34 Walnut Grove	0	0	0	0.0%	0.0%
35 South Parkway	0	0	0	0.0%	0.0%
36 Hacks Cross	0	0	0	0.0%	0.0%
37 Perkins	0	0	0	0.0%	0.0%
38 Boxtown	0	0	0	0.0%	0.0%
39 South Third	0	0	0	0.0%	0.0%
40 Wolfchase	-97,632,990	-21,135,304	-56,849,910	21.6%	58.2%
40 Wolfchase A	19,642,140	4,252,073	11,437,260	21.6%	58.2%
40 Wolfchase B	72,359,820	16,716,691	43,695,015	23.1%	60.4%
40 Wolfchase C	40,139,700	9,947,629	25,362,180	24.8%	63.2%
42 Crosstown	0	0	0	0.0%	0.0%
44 Goodlett Farms (new route)	29,949,750	2,399,197	17,097,750	8.0%	57.1%
46 Whitehaven	-5,169,615	-1,849,387	-4,445,160	35.8%	86.0%
47 Shelby Farms Park	-0,100,010	- 1,040,007		33.0 /	50.070
(new route)	3,897,960	340,274	2,529,120	8.7%	64,9%
50 Poplar	0	0	0	0.0%	0.0%

INVUIES OF 9/27/16 ITEM ITEM

52 Jackson	0	0	0	0.0%	0.0%
53 Summer	0	0	0	0.0%	0.0%
56 Lamar	0	0	0	0.0%	0.0%
57 Park 64 Airport Shuttle	0	0	0	0.0%	0.0%
(new route)	7,635,095	3,015,179	6,972,030	39.5%	91.3%
69 Winchester	0	0	0	0.0%	0.0%
77 West Memphis	0	0	0	0.0%	0.0%
78 West Memphis Express	0	0	0	0.0%	0.0%
82 Germantown	0	0	0	0.0%	0.0%
98 W Memphis Green	0	0	0	0.0%	0.0%
99 Nonconnah	-4,736,880	-1,679,940	-4,626,720	35.5%	97.7%
100 Trolley Main Line	0	0	0	0.0%	0.0%
101 Trolley Riverfront	0	0	0	0.0%	0.0%
102 Trolley Madison Line	0	0	0	0.0%	0.0%
All Changes	84,715,280	16,675,949	55,352,105	19.7%	65.3%

	Low Income	Minority
Change Borne By	19.7%	65.3%
Area Average	25.5%	70.0%
Delta	-5.8%	-4.7%